IJCRT.ORG

ISSN: 2320-2882



INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF CREATIVE RESEARCH THOUGHTS (IJCRT)

An International Open Access, Peer-reviewed, Refereed Journal

Reading The Harrowing Realities In Nair's 'The Chain Of Custody"

Sudipta Banerjee

Abstract:

Violence in literature serves as a riveting device of record, deeply entwined in the human condition and shedding light on societal norms, conflicts and transformation. From the time of origin till the postmodern tales, the depiction of violence has evolved reflecting changes in cultural, philosophical and psychological understanding of human behaviour and morality. Literature has not only captured the violence embedded in human societies but has always investigated its roots and upshot. In classical texts, violence has been employed to picturize the valour and virtues, portraying violence with a magnificent aura, almost in a glorified manner, stressing on the key-themes of epic tales revolving round themes of bravery and sacrifice. With the evolution of literature passing through ages, the presentation of violence becomes more subtle and critical. One come across the intersectionality involves in brutality while turning over the pages of any Shakesperean dramas. In Modern literature Violence often serves as a reviewer of social and political structures. Postmodern literature continues to wrestle with violence, periodically raising questions on the very nature of reality and representation. These texts evoke the readers to reflect on the cynical nature of violence and its extensive impact on human history and identity.

The aim of the researcher is to deal with a new form of "Constructed Violence" that is recently being addressed by the writers of the last decade, centering round a global social crime, in the name of Human Trafficking. Trafficking involves the dislocation and transportation of human beings stirred by socioeconomic factors mainly implemented by the use of fraud and deception on the part of perpetrators. Trafficking as an institutional form of violence typifies the systemic and prevalent exploitation existing permanently in the form of modern-day slavery. Trafficking is not at all an isolated criminal act but a deeply ingrained mechanism of oppression; strengthen by economic, social, and political structures that conserve inequality and marginalisation. The paper will aim to look at the process of trafficking in woman and child and the set up of violence that a victim is subjected too. Secondly, the paper will look at the role of society as a scavenger also society as a rescuer in the process. For the purpose, the researcher will read the kind of violence that the act of trafficking involves which is being addressed in the pages of the novel "Chain of Custody" by renowned Indian Novelist Anita Nair.

Key- words: Violence, Trafficking, Institutions, Crime, Literature

Introduction- Literature and Violence:

Being abusive is always a choice. Violence needs a cause and a purpose. Unfortunately in today's world the choice of being violent holds no consequence. As Rushdie pens down, Literature is a place to explore the highest and the lowest places in human society so do in spirit. So do a Writer adopts various tool for his artistic pursuit. Fictions involve the act of imagination. Writers while writing their stories do amalgamate the material real with their own mindful realities thus lending a pass for the readers to get into the dual realities willingly creating a third world comprising of the readers reaction to the text. Violence is one such recurrent motif from the remaining stocks that an author has. Literature always considers violence as a trope to look into the power dynamics, the relationships shaped and structured on the basis of power and domination. Violence has been imbedded within the history human civilization. The term Violence is derived from Latin word, Violentia, which implies an intense force. Violence is an act of force with an intention to cause harm. There are different ways of manifesting violence, not necessarily it has to be always an expression in physical term. Violence can be passive in nature too. In the darker romances or the gothic tales violence is the predominant theme of writing. Even the speciality of gothic tales lies within their macabre structures and buildings that set the mood of approaching violence. An offbeat instance from the collection of gothics, which presents Violence not only being a theme but rather violence personified. It is Mary Shelly's Frankenstein. The Monster is the product of scientific violence that Victor Frankenstein gives birth to defying the natural cycle of birth. The monster being a product of such violence is further tortured when it is refused for an identity. So the violence that the monster levied on the rest can be inferred as its' struggle for identity. After the world wars, the treatment and even the term of violence were altogether different. The perspective towards violence changed in the post-war period. There is a shift in the creation and the reception of a text. World wars, particularly the second one witness the height of organised racial violence. Holocaust will enshrined as an epoch of brutality. The war violence in literature finds passage through the stream of consciousness technique. The fragmented thoughts, the sudden jolt, shift of moods are not the natural trends but rather they are the traits that resulted from the disillusionment of modernization aggravated by the horrors of war. Literature was loaded with the horror and the anguish of war. One can refer to Katherine Mansfield's story "The Fly" suggesting the enormity of war. The Boss's drowning of a fly in an ink pot suggests the brutality and the horror of the war. The act of the Boss is triggered by his personal loss of his son who was very much like the helpless fly which can't flew right away from the war place. Mansfield depiction of the 'fly' with its little front legs waving for a cry of help speaks about atrociousness of war. It speaks of the lasting psychological consequences of warfare for survivors and their loved ones. Violence of war leads to a path-breaking concept in modern psychological realms, the post traumatic stress disorder. In her works, Woolf presents instances which show the impact of war deeply probing into individual's psyches portraying characters suffering from severe shell shockinfused with anxiety, nightmares, tremor and impaired sight and hearing- after being exposed to the exploding shells on the battlefield.

The scope of violence is continually evolving, going beyond its overtly physical manifestations to more surreptious psychological and institutional practices. Literature always incorporate acts of violence to indicate some larger suffering. There are two kinds of violence in literature- when a character inflicts harm on oneself or each other. And the other one is the harm that is caused as a part of the narrative. The difference between the two is the share of guilt lies only in the second case when the harm is caused for the sake of plot-line. Violence enables the readers to understand the character in deeper level stretching the readers to build an emotional connectivity with the character. Thomas Foster in his book "How to Read Literature Like a Professor" (chapter-11) says that Literature won't survive without violence. Violence gives a more realistic touch to the writing. Literature portrays human mind. It is the subconscious which triggers the violent self in an individual to set for vengeance. That unspoken self which remain repressed and conditioned by the conscious surrounding when has its' sudden outburst becomes an event full of violence. Even a writer in his crafting of violence has to be careful in his creation throughout by the abuse of pen, known as literary violence. One can reflect Ginsberg's use of pen which led him to trial for

obscenity, the pen howled against the dominant stream of tradition, the violence that has been practiced against young minds in the name of so called culture is retreated back by a similar drunken delirium rather more violent in their outlooks and senses.

The fundamental of all violent activities has to be the inequalities that grow and operate within the society. Violence is not only to be interpreted as an act of defying social and judicial codes but also it serves as an aqueduct to get into the relationships shared by structures of society and how far these structures contribute to the cause of violence. With the progress of civilization, it's not that we have turned to be civilised but rather we have learn to adopt and implement violence in a more civilised manner. Violence is the most popular thing that our world is attracted to; it's the most progressive of all things. Today living in the sphere of print and digital media, we are subtly exposed to violence in structured form. From reading newspapers to watching television screens, social media platform every day we are informed with acts of violence in different forms. There is no such semi-permeable membrane that can stop the penetration of scenes full of betrayal, anguish into our own cosy structures. We all are non-resistant receiver and yielding practitioner of Violence. There are various factors catering violence are-social, economic, political which shapes the other -the personal, depending on these factors the pattern of violence changes. Any writing of recent times has to be designed in the backdrop of violence as violence is inescapable in the modern society. In contemporary world the word violence has gain a more wide usage because of heralding peace. But it is to be noted that even in achieving peace there is an implementation of force in the name of rules which are in harshest forms of physical and psychological brutality. There is no as such justification behind penning down scene of violence; writing of war violence in reality does not stop war. But writings of violence may be taken as cautionary words, a kind prevention better than cure but not ensure the ultimate elimination of the disease. What a novel or fiction writer does by writing horrors and savagery can be read as a cathartic response to the reality. It is the aesthetic quality of art that to enable you to gulf your exhaustion and feelings and place it in a manner as to have a kind dialysis of feelings. The writer even writes violence as a kind of resistance to the physical reality to which he can't respond or the physical reality necessarily do not accord to the writer's response. Reality is gliding of events, having a momentum of its own. All a Wordsmith attempts for is to create a metamorphosed version of the exterior and to seek a relief from the ultra version of corporeal world. This is what has been a justification for ages by the penholders to provide for the inclusion of violence in the texts. Violence too serves the aesthetic goal of an artist, inflicting violence on the characters (if violence is solely for the purpose of narrative) or even if the character being responsible for the hamper, in either of the case the readers finds a sense of unification with characters. A writer brings an abridged version of violent experiences by compressing all into a single or a handful of characters thus narrowing down the scope of the real event. Fictional violence is a metaphor for the real one.

Trafficking and Vulnerability:

This paper will look into the phenomenon of Human Trafficking as a structural form of Violence. Human Trafficking is an organised recognised and even identified crime. As defined by United Nations, Office of Drugs and Crime, Human Trafficking is the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of people through force, fraud or deception, with the aim of exploiting them for profit. Men, women and children of all ages and from all backgrounds can became victims of this crime, which occurs in every region of world. The traffickers often use violence or fraudulent employment agencies and fake promises of education and job opportunities to trick and coerce their victims. In a very compact manner the definition not only explain the process of trafficking but also refers to the reasons or factors contributing to the cause. Also highlighting means adopted by traffickers to lure their targeted individual. This being the target of the trafficker is something to be call as being vulnerable. What are the deciding factors of vulnerability? Or who can be more prone to trafficking. Vulnerability is different from risk. Vulnerability refers to certain characteristics or situations that are specific to persons and specific to context, can lead the risk of a person being trafficked. Risk operates on these given set of conditions and situations. Vulnerability inducing factors can be break into the following heads-

- **Personal** encompassing *Age*, *gender*, *disability*, *ethnicity*.
- **Situational** involving temporary illness, destitution, unemployment, legal status.
- **Contextual-** *Discriminatory laws, policies and social norms, crises and armed conflicts* constitute the contextual factors

All these factors contribute and act together increasing the risk of trafficking directed against certain individuals, communities or groups who are subscribing to these factors of being vulnerable. A personal vulnerability factor are characteristics that are intrinsic to every individuals, a personal trait becomes a vulnerability factor when it communicate with a given set of contexts and situations. Situational factors of vulnerability are creeping of obstacles- mostly economic in nature that adversely impact an individual in a specific context. A situational factor prevails for a prolonged period of time as compare to that of personal factors. Contextual vulnerability factors comprises of structural elements and physical environment that impacts a person's situation- it can be the lack of adequate knowledge regarding individual right, war like situation, ecological crisis and disaster often increases the risk of being vulnerable. Judith Butler, differentiate between precariousness and precarity. For her, precariousness is a universal and generalised phenomenon the root of which is the fact that all humans are interdependent on one another and therefore all are vulnerable whereas precarity is unevenly distributed. Precarity is mainly experienced by the marginalised section of the society. This marginalised strata which is either experiencing economic insecurity, violence and force migration.

Martha Fineman's theory regarding vulnerability consider all humans are inborn vulnerable (Universal Vulnerability). This vulnerability is not limited in being physically weak rather conditioned by socioeconomic and institutional dependencies. There is no degree of vulnerability accounting as more or less vulnerable but rather experiencing vulnerability in different ways. This theory provides a critical layout for getting into the role played by law and society creating vulnerability for humans. The victims in trafficking are obviously the one whose victimhood is featured by situations identified as Situational Vulnerability. Those framed as vulnerable can be treated as lacking in agency and in need for control from falling a prey of coercive tactics without any benevolent façade. Trafficking for sexual exploitation often coalesce with sex work in general to produce an image of all sex workers as trafficked individuals so in need to be rescued without taking in account the fact that there may be some in this profession who are exercising meaningful choice due to the limited and unattractive range of options available for survival. People do however vary in their degree of resilience, being largely shaped by or ability is largely developed by social institutions, particularly those of the state. Fineman critically points out the responsibility of the State, recommending a shift from recent neo-liberal stress on individual liability towards institutional accountability where structures and systems are need to design aiming to support human prosperity.

Trafficking as an Institution:

Trafficking as an institutional form of violence, typify the systemic and prevalent exploitation existing permanently in the form of modern day slavery. This process is not merely a band of isolated criminal acts but involves a deep ingrained mechanism of oppression, perpetuated by economic, social and political structures that sustain inequality and marginalization. Trafficking in humans exists in various forms, including forced labour, sexual exploitation, organ transplant each contributing to a broader narrative of human rights violation and social injustice. Society operates in the line of Darwinian logic for survival of the fittest. There is interconnectedness between trafficking in persons and various institutions. Trafficking is identified as the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons through force, found or coercion with a single motive to exploit. Organisational violence involves methodical patterns of injury protracted by various social, political, or economic establishments. Factors including poverty, gender inequality, lack of legal protection, corruption foster

environment suitable for exploitation acting as a base to the crime, the superstructure of which is shaped by parameters such as education and culture. Nations, borders, migration, global supply chains all contribute in perpetuating trafficking networks. Various forms of social identities such as gender, race, class and nationality, which intensifies vulnerabilities shares a hand in the institutionalisation of crime. Women and girls are unevenly affected by trafficking, in the context of sexual exploitation, due to entrenched gender difference and preferential social norms. Risks for trafficking become more acute for migrants and fugitives, especially those lacking proper legal documentation.

There are lacunas in the legal framework and enforcement of laws for combating trafficking. The legitimization of Brothel quarters and the process of acquiring trade license itself is validating the transportation and harbouring of labour. The law furthermore differentiate in the forms of sexual labour. The law is demarcating those who are willingly there in prostitution from the ones who are forcefully abducted. Willingness or consent is generated due to systemic vulnerability. Inducing factors like poverty, unemployment, lack of education, financial needs and cultural roots all spawn the process of approval. The law is demarcating those who are willingly there in prostitution from the ones who are forcefully abducted. Willingness or consent is generated due to systematic vulnerability. Inducing factors like poverty, unemployment, lack of education, financial needs and cultural roots all spawn the process of approval.

There are three categories under which trafficking of women are generally analysed- the gendered perspective to trafficking, trafficking at the cost of human right violations and the third one which is not much taken into consideration is the market driven trafficking. There is a socio-regional difference in organizational operation involved in trafficking trade. All the traffickers are part of the larger trade which further connects them together in international transportation. The deficit in the local law executing bodies or organs those working in the bodies and the custom officials' functions facilitate the operation of the trade across borders. Trafficking is looming all the more mainly because of the financial assistance that the traffickers get from the West.

Theoretical framework and Cycles of Trafficking:

A well knit understanding and effective response to trafficking must address the economic and social fabrics that are fundamental in sustaining the crime. The Base in Marxist theory comprises of the economic foundations of society, including the modes of production, relation of production, and economic institutions. The Superstructure, on the other hand encompasses the cultural, political, legal and ideological system and institutions that arise from and are shaped by economic base. Human Trafficking can be interpreted or read as an economic activity rooted in capitalist mode of production, which forms part of the base. The pecuniary stimulation behind Trafficking is navigated by the demand for cheap labour and the exploitation of vulnerable populations for the sake of profit. In capitalist system, profit maximization is ultimate goal and trafficking is dark yet lucrative manifestation of this drive. Traffickers make use of victims for forced labour, sexual exploitation, and other forms of modern slavery. The superstructure crafted by the economic base, then plays a crucial role in either perpetuating or creating conditions that allow the trade to thrive. Legal systems, for example, may lack strict laws and enforcement mechanisms against trafficking, reflecting and reinforcing the interests of those who benefit economically from the exploitation. Furthermore, ideological systems, such as attitudes, can either blur the realities of trafficking or foster cliché thoughts that dehumanize victims and justify their exploitation. In capitalist line of production, labour is turned down to a mere input required in the process of production only insofar as it contributes to profit. Individuals are plundered of their sovereignity and expose to severe forms of exploitation, foregrounding the dehumanizing tendencies which is intrinsic to capitalist relations of production. The Base and Superstructure model of Marxist theory reveals the ingrained economic roots of this exploitation and the ways in which societal institutions and ideologies sustain and justify it.

At the heart of the trade lies the ever increasing demand for cheap labour force, commercial sex and consumption of goods and services produced by the exploitation of trafficked labour Demand stimulated factors- Consumerism, globalization and targeted profit stroke up the supply of trafficked persons and perpetuate the cycle of exploitation. Only legal measures are not enough to address the demand side of the crime. There is a need for broader societal outlook towards oppression for reclaiming the inherent dignity and rights of all individuals The strategies for battling the demand for cheap commercial labour include strong consumer awareness campaigning holding those business organization accountable or responsible for their supply chains. The cyclic flow of trafficking as a trade practice runs through a complex network of economic transactions and market- steered forces that facilitate the exploitation of persons for profit. This business model is based on supply and demand principles; in which trafficker make use of vulnerabilities in supplying cheap labour or commercial sex to meet market demands. The recruitment phase acts as the epicentre of this mechanism where traffickers explore and identifies the vulnerable population from economically backward communities and make them their soft targets. They adopt means highlighting lucrative promises of employment, education, or better living conditions to attract victims. Once recruited, victims are trans-located through various means, crossing international borders, facilitated by corrupt officials and duplicitous documentation upon reaching the destination traffickers harbour or channel in industries such as agriculture, construction domestic work and sex work. It is in these work sites that the commercial mode becomes apparent, operated by consumers and business enterprises seeking low cost labour or services. The profitability of the trade is maintained through a set of coercive practices such as debt bondage, threats and physical violence to seek victim's approval and silence in a structured manner.

The flow of cash within this model is sophisticated in its outlook. Money or profit earns from elsewhere illegitimate sources are invested are invested in trafficking industries to earn the cash back in the form of legitimate economic sources. Shell companies, offshore accounts, and informal banking systems are some of the means through which traffickers blur their sources of earning profit in order to avoid detection by authorities. Traffickers have widely circulated network across globe which involves supplying of cheap labour furthermore helping in sustaining the crime. Companies who look for reducing the cost of production often seek these supply chains with trafficked labour either knowingly or negligently. In conclusion, the mercantile mechanism in the trafficking trade is encouraged by economic incentives, market demands and systemic vulnerabilities (the weakness or risks that arise from the structure or functioning of a whole system).

Trafficking through Nair's Lens:

Anita Nair is an Indian novelist who writes her books in English language. She has won a fellowship from Virginia Centre of Creative Arts. She received Kerala Sahitya Academy Awards for her contribution to literature and culture in 2012. Her work "Idris Keeper of the Light" was shortlisted for Hindu literary Prize 2014. She has won Orange Prize for Fictions. Her works has been translated into twenty one languages across the world. She has been appointed in 2020 as high profile supporter of United Nations High Commissioners for Refugees. The dominant theme of her writing deal with the distasteful condition of human life, grounded very much on reality. Her book "Chain of Custody" is interpreted mainly under the popular genre of crime fictions or thriller. Nair has picked her pain to set the narrative in the framework of crime fiction to deliver an account of far more heinous crime, trafficking in children. Nair chose Crime fiction for her social commentary. As per Nair, Crime fiction is at very natal stage of development. The chances of it gaining popularity like Scandinavian noir will happen when the plot and characters have greater paradigms and greater cause of appeal than just dime a dozen crime scenes. She also says that in a crime fiction the focus is on the narrative and not on any individual character thus emphasising on the circumstance in which the crime takes place. As a writer she has removed herself from it and focus on the condition more to place it in its original form.

The novel transgress the glittering image of the metropolitan and presents the alleys and streets of the city Bangalore, where children before reaching their teens loss their springs and fall in trap of traffickers

finding themselves in prostitution or other manual task. Nair in an interview with *The Hindu*, says that her work is to capture the city in its transforming days, and not to adore or denigrate it. Nair mixed elements of commercial and literary fiction to deliver a delicate picture of child trafficking and its players. According to National Human Right Commission of India over 40,000 children are reported missing each year of which 11,000 remain untraced. In 2020, the government reported identifying 6,622 trafficking victims and 694 potential trafficking victims compared with 5,145 trafficking victims and 2,505 potential victims identified in 2019. Nair's writing of the issue is based on her first hand experience that she gains while spending hours with Bangalore Oniyavara Seva Coota(BOSCO), an NGO that works with the rescuing and rehabilitation of the victims caught in this modern day slavery.

Though shape in a form of thriller, but the work makes the reader to think taking him/her beyond the narrative and indulging more in the thought of the reality and how any girl like Nandita in the novel becomes a easy prey. It's not the story of a Nandita, but Nandita encompass so many unknown and unidentified in her. Through the fictional lens the writer is posing some arguments that who supposed to hold the responsibility for Nandita's plight. Though Nair has tried to substitute the functioning of this crime by creating the character of Inspector Gowda, who serves as Nair's alter ego, as Nair put it in words. Nair says that she would have reacted like Gowda with same level of disgust and steadily would have taken steps and acted as saviour. If society acting as a perpetrator of the crime like Aunty who lured Nanadita falsely assuring her to take her to the church, then there are people like Gowda and the NGO runner Urmila without whom the novel would have appeared highly cynical. Gowda and Urmila are characters created to reach equilibrium to balance the harshness and cynicism. Readers also felt relieved to read such characters even been aware of the cause they are trying to serve.

Aunty is just a part of the larger whole that runs the crime. As the novel shows that one can't blame any particular for the crime. Bangalore, being the silicon world, a space for high salaried jobs, well paid pensioners, adventures, prolonged traffic jams, an exciting place of visitors, and mainly young aged along with its highly esteemed culture from silk sarees to music to rava idli, ragi mudde being accompanied with politicians, policemen, real estate dealers, and cucumber sellers form a network to trap children from different states and countries. This is not only the sight of Bangalore but any and every Metropolitan emerged out to be the same thing. Lining up in the crime of trafficking four metropolitan cities are the hubs of traffickers- Bangalore, Delhi, Mumbai, and Kolkata. Writers like Nair, in their adaptation of crime thriller has tried in every means to present the other unaccustomed side of cities we live in or come across. When asked what she wants to attain from the writing of this fiction, Nair clearly stated that she is not writing to find solutions to the problem but her writing is directed to laymen who can't get into the theoretical frameworks of the crime or the driving factors behind it for them the novel will definitely act serve as an illumination. Writers on this issue is choosing violent scenes to present the brutal side of human beings which is driven by money making instinct and trying to present in front of us the violence next door, not required to turn the pages of history but this very organised modern day slavery will surpass any former instances of violence in terms of its mechanisation and strategies involved, also the heedlessness that we bear towards this crime.

The novel addresses the systemic and structural challenges in fighting trafficking. Nair points out the insufficiencies in legal framework and the implementation of the anti-trafficking laws. The frustration led out by Inspector Gowda for bureaucratic red tape and lack of resources. Nair highlights the systemic errors that hinder the effective action against trafficking. Furthermore, the novel sheds light on the international dimensions of trafficking. Nair acknowledges the global chains and its role in perpetuating the crime. Bangalore is connected to the larger macrocosmic whole shedding light on trans- national association of the crime being portrayed by the growth and affluences of real estate dealers in the novel dealing and maintaining a considerable creamy transaction in foreign banks.

Conclusion:

The narrative brings the dark underbelly of human trafficking. Through its convulated plot it foregrounds the socio-economic conditions that perpetuate the crime, the collusion and challenges within law enforcement and the extreme human impact on victims and their families. Nairs' work serves as captivating call to action, urging society to confront the systemic issues that enable trafficking and to provide comprehensive support for survivors.

Works Cited:

- 1. "AuthorAnitaNair." DeccanChronicle, www.deccanchronicle.com/content/tags/author-anitanair.Accessed 25 May 2023
- the Future of Crime Fiction 2. "Authors Weigh in on in India."India Apr.2017, www.indiatoday.in/lifestyle/culture/story/ashwin-sanghi-crimewriter-crime-writing-futureindia-lifest-969032-2017-04-02.
- 3. Fineman, Martha Albetson. "The Vulnerable Subject: Anchoring Equality in the Human Condition." Yale Journal of Law & Feminism, vol. 20, no.1, 2008, pp.1-23. Digital Commons, https://digitalcommons.law.yale.edu/yjlf/vol20/iss1/2. Accessed 2 May 2024.
- 4. Foster, Thomas C. How to Read Literature Like Professor. M.S. Effie, 2023, https://mseffie.com/assignments/professor/How%20to%20Read%20Literature%20like% 20a%20Professor%201st.pdf. Accessed 1 May 2024.
- 5. Matusek, Karmen Marie. "Under the Surface of Sex Trafficking: Socio-Economic and Cultural Perpetrators of Gender- Based Violence in India." Master's thesis, Old Dominion University, 2016, pp. 66-82. Digital Commons, https://digitalcommons.odu.edu/gpis_etds/8. Accessed 3 May 2024.
- 6. Nair, Anita. Chain of Custody: An Inspector Gowda Novel. Bitter Lemon Press, 2016
- 7. Rigsby, Ellen M. "Book Review: Precarious Life: The Power of Mourning and violence". Law, Culture and the Humanities, vol.1,no.3,2005,pp.403-405,https://doi.org/10.1177/174387210500100312.
- 8. Vulnerability and the Human in Judith Butler's and Adriana Cavarero's...journalredescriptions.org/articles/10.33134/rds.342/gallery/362/download/. Accessed 15June 2023.