



# A Comparative Study Of Shareholder's Ethics To That Of Management Ethics

**Anuradha Chauhan**

**Advocate**

**Jiwaji University**

## **Abstract:**

Ethics plays a vital role in the corporate world, as it shapes the behaviour and decision-making processes of both shareholders and management. This comparative study aims to analyse and explore the differences and similarities between shareholder ethics and management ethics. By examining the ethical considerations, responsibilities, and accountability of these two key stakeholders, this study seeks to provide a comprehensive understanding of the ethical dimensions within organizations. The research will utilize a combination of theoretical frameworks, empirical data, case studies, and ethical theories to establish a foundation for analyzing and comparing the ethical behaviors of shareholders and management.

## **Table of Contents:**

### Introduction

- 1.1 Ethical Theories and Models
- 1.2 Shareholder's Ethics
- 1.3 Management Ethics

### Ethics in Shareholder-Management Relationship

- 2.1 Agency Theory and Shareholder-Management Relationship
- 2.2 Ethical Considerations in Shareholder-Management Relationship
- 2.3 Shareholder Activism and Ethical Concerns

### Ethical Responsibilities of Shareholders

- 3.1 Fiduciary Duties and Shareholder Responsibility
- 3.2 Shareholder Activism and Corporate Governance
- 3.3 Ethical Investment and Socially Responsible Investing

## Ethical Responsibilities of Management

- 4.1 Ethical Leadership and Corporate Culture
- 4.2 Stakeholder Theory and Management Ethics
- 4.3 Ethical Decision-Making in Management

## Comparative Analysis of Shareholder's Ethics and Management Ethics

- 5.1 Ethical Decision-Making Processes
- 5.2 Accountability and Responsibility
- 5.3 Conflict of Interest
- 5.4 Alignment of Ethical Goals

## Case Studies: Examining Ethical Dilemmas in Shareholder-Management Interactions

- 6.1 Enron Scandal: Shareholder and Management Ethical Failures
- 6.2 Volkswagen Emissions Scandal: Ethical Implications for Shareholders and Management
- 6.3 Patagonia: A Case of Ethical Alignment Between Shareholders and Management

## Ethical Best Practices for Shareholders and Management

- 7.1 Developing Ethical Guidelines and Codes of Conduct
- 7.2 Promoting Ethical Awareness and Education
- 7.3 Encouraging Transparency and Accountability

## 8. Conclusion

- 8.1 Summary of Findings
- 8.2 Implications and Recommendations
- 8.3 Future Research Directions

### **1.1 Ethical Theories and Models:**

Ethical theories and models provide frameworks for understanding and evaluating ethical issues and dilemmas. Here are a few commonly discussed ethical theories and models<sup>1</sup>:

1. Utilitarianism: Utilitarianism is a consequentialist ethical theory that suggests actions should be judged based on their ability to maximize overall happiness or utility. According to utilitarianism, the morally right action is the one that produces the greatest amount of happiness for the greatest number of people.
2. Deontology: Deontology is an ethical theory that focuses on the inherent nature of actions rather than their consequences. It suggests that certain actions are inherently right or wrong, regardless of their outcomes. Deontological ethics often emphasizes principles such as respect for autonomy, honesty, and fairness.

<sup>1</sup>LarryChonko, *Ethical Theories*, DSEF, available at: <https://dsef.org/wpcontent/uploads/2012/07/EthicalTheories.pdf>.

3. **Virtue Ethics:** Virtue ethics emphasizes the development of moral character and the cultivation of virtues. It focuses on what kind of person one should be rather than specific actions or consequences. Virtue ethics suggests that moral decisions should be guided by virtues like honesty, integrity, compassion, and courage.
4. **Rights-Based Ethics:** Rights-based ethics, also known as deontological ethics, asserts that individuals have certain fundamental rights that should be respected and protected. These rights can include life, liberty, privacy, and freedom of expression. Actions are evaluated based on their adherence to these rights.
5. **Ethical Relativism:** Ethical relativism argues that moral principles and values are subjective and vary across different individuals, cultures, and societies. It suggests that what is considered ethical may differ depending on the cultural or societal context. However, ethical relativism can be challenging when faced with conflicting moral beliefs.

## 1.2 Shareholder's Ethics:

Shareholder ethics<sup>2</sup> refers to the ethical considerations and responsibilities of shareholders in a business context. Shareholders are individuals or entities that own shares or stocks in a company. Here are some key aspects of shareholder ethics:

1. **Fiduciary Duty:** Shareholders have a fiduciary duty to act in the best interests of the company and its stakeholders. This means they should make decisions that maximize shareholder value while considering the long-term sustainability and welfare of the company.
2. **Transparency and Disclosure:** Shareholders have an ethical responsibility to promote transparency and ensure accurate and timely disclosure of information to other shareholders and stakeholders. This includes financial reporting, corporate governance practices, and potential conflicts of interest.
3. **Ethical Investing:** Shareholders may consider ethical investing practices by aligning their investments with their ethical values. This involves investing in companies that adhere to certain environmental, social, and governance (ESG) criteria, such as promoting sustainability, social responsibility, and ethical business practices.
4. **Responsible Shareholder Activism:** Shareholders have the right to engage in shareholder activism to influence corporate policies and practices. Ethical shareholder activism involves advocating for positive changes while considering the impact on various stakeholders and avoiding actions that may harm the company's long-term viability.
5. **Avoidance of Insider Trading:** Shareholders should adhere to legal and ethical guidelines regarding insider trading. It is unethical to trade stocks based on non-public information that could give an unfair advantage, as it undermines market fairness and integrity.

<sup>2</sup>Daniel Gaura, *Shareholder theory*, CEOPEDIA MANAGEMENT ONLINE, (20, March 2023), available at: [https://ceopedia.org/index.php/Shareholder\\_theory](https://ceopedia.org/index.php/Shareholder_theory).

### 1.3 Management Ethics:

Management ethics refers to the ethical considerations and responsibilities of managers<sup>3</sup> in organizations.

Here are some important aspects of management ethics:

1. **Ethical Leadership:** Managers should demonstrate ethical leadership by setting a positive example and promoting ethical behaviour within the organization. They should act with integrity, fairness, and transparency, and encourage employees to do the same.
2. **Decision-Making:** Managers face ethical dilemmas when making decisions that may impact various stakeholders. Ethical managers consider the potential consequences of their decisions, respect the rights of individuals, and make choices that align with ethical principles and organizational values.

Employee Treatment: (Ethical Managers):

Ethical managers prioritize fair and respectful treatment of employees, recognizing their rights, well-being, and overall dignity. Here are some key aspects of how ethical managers should approach employee treatment:

1. **Respect and Dignity:** Ethical managers treat employees with respect, valuing their individual worth and recognizing their unique contributions. They create a positive work environment where everyone feels valued and appreciated, regardless of their position or role.
2. **Fairness and Equity:** Ethical managers strive for fairness and equity in their treatment of employees. They ensure that policies, procedures, and decision-making processes are transparent, consistent, and unbiased. They do not show favoritism or discriminate based on factors such as gender, race, age, religion, or disability.
3. **Open Communication:** Ethical managers foster open and honest communication with their employees. They encourage a culture where employees feel comfortable expressing their opinions, concerns, and ideas without fear of retaliation. They actively listen to their employees and take their feedback into account when making decisions that affect them.
4. **Work-Life Balance:** Ethical managers recognize the importance of work-life balance and strive to support their employees in achieving it. They promote reasonable working hours, discourage excessive overtime, and encourage employees to take breaks and vacations. They understand that employees' well-being outside of work impacts their productivity and overall job satisfaction.
5. **Development and Growth:** Ethical managers invest in the development and growth of their employees. They provide opportunities for training, skill-building, and career advancement. They support their employees' professional goals and aspirations, providing guidance and mentorship to help them reach their full potential.

<sup>3</sup> Tanuja A, *Management Ethics: Meaning, Need and Importance*, BUSINESS MANAGEMENT IDEAS, available at: <https://www.businessmanagementideas.com/notes/management-notes/corporate-social-responsibility/management-ethics-meaning-need-and-importance/5319>.

6. Recognition and Rewards: Ethical managers acknowledge and appreciate their employees' contributions. They provide regular feedback and recognition for a job well done. They also ensure that rewards and promotions are based on merit and performance, rather than personal biases or favouritism.
7. Ethical Leadership: Ethical managers lead by example, demonstrating integrity, honesty, and ethical behaviour. They hold themselves accountable for their actions and decisions, and they expect the same from their employees. They promote an ethical culture within the organization, where honesty, transparency, and ethical conduct are valued.

Overall, ethical managers prioritize the well-being, rights, and dignity of their employees. They create a positive work environment where employees feel respected, valued, and motivated to perform their best. By treating employees ethically, they contribute to a more productive and engaged workforce, fostering long-term success for both the employees and the organization as a whole.

## **2.Ethics in Shareholder-Management Relationship**

### **2.1 Agency Theory and Shareholder-Management Relationship:**

Agency theory is a widely recognized framework that helps explain the relationship between shareholders and management in a corporation. According to this theory, shareholders are the principals who delegate decision-making authority to management, who act as their agents. The theory assumes that there is a natural conflict of interest between shareholders and managers due to the divergence of their goals and incentives.

Shareholders primarily seek to maximize their wealth through dividends and capital appreciation, while managers are motivated by various factors such as job security, power, and personal financial gains. This misalignment of interests can lead to agency problems, where managers may pursue actions that benefit themselves at the expense of shareholders' interests.

To mitigate these agency problems and align the interests of shareholders and managers, mechanisms such as performance-based incentives, stock options, and board oversight are commonly employed. However, ethical issues can arise in this relationship, as discussed in the following sections<sup>4</sup>.

### **2.2 Ethical Considerations in Shareholder-Management Relationship:**

The shareholder-management relationship raises several ethical considerations that need to be addressed. Here are some key ethical issues<sup>5</sup>:

---

<sup>4</sup>Carolm. Kopp, *Agency Theory: Definition, Examples of Relationships, and Disputes*, INVESTOPEDIA, (04, September 2021), available at: <https://www.investopedia.com/terms/a/agencytheory.asp#:~:text=Agency%20theory%20is%20a%20principle,and%20comp any%20executives%2C%20as%20agents..>

<sup>5</sup>Indeed Editorial Team, *What Is Ethical Management? (Plus Benefits and Examples)*, INDEED, (25, June 2022), available at: <https://www.indeed.com/career-advice/career-development/what-is-ethical-management>.

1. **Fiduciary Duty:** Managers have a fiduciary duty to act in the best interests of the shareholders. This duty implies an ethical responsibility to prioritize shareholder welfare over personal gain or other conflicting interests.
2. **Transparency and Disclosure:** Ethical concerns arise when there is a lack of transparency or inadequate disclosure of information by management. Shareholders rely on accurate and timely information to make informed decisions, and withholding or manipulating information can undermine their trust and result in unethical behaviour.
3. **Executive Compensation:** Determining executive compensation raises ethical questions. Excessive or unjustifiable compensation packages, especially when they are not aligned with company performance or shareholder returns, can be seen as unethical.
4. **Risk Management:** Managers must balance risk and return while making decisions. Ethical concerns arise when managers take excessive risks that jeopardize shareholder value, as seen in cases such as the 2008 financial crisis. It is crucial to exercise responsible risk management practices.
5. **Stakeholder Consideration:** Ethical behaviour involves considering the interests of various stakeholders, not just shareholders. Managers should recognize and balance the needs of employees, customers, communities, and the environment while making decisions that affect the overall well-being of the organization.

### 2.3 Shareholder Activism and Ethical Concerns:

Shareholder activism<sup>6</sup> refers to shareholders' active involvement in influencing corporate decisions, often driven by ethical concerns. Activist shareholders advocate for changes they believe will enhance long-term shareholder value or align corporate practices with certain ethical standards. While shareholder activism can be a positive force for corporate governance, it also raises ethical concerns:

1. **Short-Termism:** Some activist shareholders may prioritize short-term financial gains over long-term sustainability, potentially pressuring management to make decisions that sacrifice long-term value creation for immediate shareholder returns. This can undermine the ethical responsibility to consider the interests of all stakeholders and the long-term viability of the company.
2. **Conflicting Ethical Standards:** Different shareholders may hold varying ethical standards and priorities. Activist interventions driven by one group's ethical concerns may clash with the views of other shareholders or stakeholders, highlighting the challenge of balancing competing ethical perspectives.
3. **Accountability and Influence:** Shareholder activism raises questions about the accountability of activist shareholders. While activism can be an important mechanism for holding management accountable, concerns arise when a small group of shareholders exerts disproportionate influence over corporate decisions, potentially undermining the democratic governance structure.

<sup>6</sup>James Chen, *What Is an Activist Shareholder? What They Do and How They Work*, IVESTOPEDIA, (30, June 2022), available at: <https://www.investopedia.com/terms/s/shareholderactivist.asp>.



Balancing the ethical considerations in the shareholder-management relationship requires promoting transparency, accountability, stakeholder consideration, responsible risk management, and long-term value creation. Striking this balance contributes to sustainable and ethical corporate practices.

### **3.Ethical Responsibilities of Shareholders**

#### **3.1 Fiduciary Duties and Shareholder Responsibility:**

Shareholders have fiduciary duties towards the company in which they hold shares. Fiduciary duties refer to the legal and ethical responsibilities that individuals have when they are entrusted with managing the assets or interests of others. In the context of shareholders, fiduciary duties require them to act in the best interests of the company and its stakeholders.

These fiduciary duties<sup>7</sup> include:

1. **Duty of loyalty:** Shareholders have a duty to act in good faith and loyalty towards the company, which means they should avoid conflicts of interest and refrain from actions that could harm the company or its stakeholders.
2. **Duty of care:** Shareholders should exercise due care and diligence when making decisions that could affect the company. This duty requires them to be informed, ask questions, and make decisions based on sound judgment.
3. **Duty to act in the best interests of the company:** Shareholders should prioritize the long-term success and sustainability of the company over short-term gains. They should consider the impact of their actions on various stakeholders, including employees, customers, suppliers, and the broader community.

It is important to note that fiduciary duties may vary across jurisdictions, and shareholders should be aware of the specific legal obligations in their respective countries.

#### **3.2 Shareholder Activism and Corporate Governance**

Shareholder activism<sup>8</sup> refers to the efforts of shareholders to influence the decision-making and governance practices of a company. It involves using shareholder rights and influence to promote changes that align with the shareholders' interests or certain social and environmental objectives.

When engaging in shareholder activism, shareholders have ethical responsibilities, including:

---

<sup>7</sup>Fiduciary Responsibility and Corporations Officers, directors, and sometimes even stockholders have fiduciary duties, or obligations of trust, NOLO, available at: <https://www.nolo.com/legal-encyclopedia/fiduciary-responsibility-corporations.html>.

<sup>8</sup>James Chen, *What Is an Activist Shareholder? What They Do and How They Work*, IVESTOPEDIA, (30, June, 2022), available at: <https://www.investopedia.com/terms/s/shareholderactivist.asp>.

1. Transparency and accountability: Shareholders should be transparent about their intentions and disclose any conflicts of interest. They should also be accountable for their actions and take responsibility for the consequences.
2. Alignment with long-term value creation: Shareholders should focus on promoting sustainable value creation and long-term success for the company and its stakeholders. They should avoid short-term profit-seeking behaviors that may compromise the company's long-term viability.
3. Respect for other stakeholders: Shareholders should consider the perspectives and interests of other stakeholders, including employees, customers, and the communities in which the company operates. They should engage in constructive dialogue and seek mutually beneficial solutions.

Effective corporate governance is crucial for ensuring shareholder rights and protecting the interests of all stakeholders. Shareholders have a responsibility to actively participate in corporate governance processes, such as voting in shareholder meetings, nominating directors, and proposing resolutions. By exercising their rights responsibly, shareholders can contribute to the overall accountability and transparency of the company.

### 3.3 Ethical Investment and Socially Responsible Investing:

Ethical investment<sup>9</sup>, also known as socially responsible investing (SRI)<sup>10</sup>, refers to the practice of considering ethical, social, and environmental factors when making investment decisions. Shareholders who engage in ethical investment have the following responsibilities:

1. Research and due diligence: Shareholders should conduct thorough research to assess the ethical practices and performance of companies before making investment decisions. This includes considering factors such as environmental impact, labor practices, human rights, and corporate governance.
2. Alignment with personal values: Shareholders should align their investment decisions with their personal values and beliefs. They should invest in companies that align with their ethical standards and support causes they find important.
3. Engaging with companies: Shareholders should actively engage with the companies they invest in to encourage responsible business practices. This can involve attending shareholder meetings, voting on resolutions, and communicating concerns or expectations to company management.
4. Balancing financial and ethical considerations: Shareholders should consider the potential financial risks and returns of their investments while also evaluating the ethical implications. Finding a balance between financial objectives and ethical considerations is essential for responsible and sustainable investing.

<sup>9</sup>Ally Streebman, *What is ethical investing?*, KOHO, available at: <https://www.koho.ca/learn/are-there-any-stocks-canadians-cant-buy/>.

<sup>10</sup>C.J. Cowton, J. Sandberg, *Socially Responsible Investment*, SCIEDIRECT, (Encyclopaedia of applied ethics (Second Edition) 2012), available at: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/topics/social-sciences/socially-responsible-investment>.



By incorporating ethical considerations into their investment decisions, shareholders can contribute to promoting positive social and environmental change and encouraging companies to adopt more responsible practices.

#### **4.Ethical Responsibilities of Management**

##### **4.1 Ethical Leadership and Corporate Culture:**

Ethical leadership<sup>11</sup> is the practice of leading by example and demonstrating a commitment to ethical behaviour in all aspects of business operations. Management has the responsibility to set the tone for ethical behaviour within the organization. Here are some key ethical responsibilities of management in this area:

1. Setting the ethical tone: Management should establish a corporate culture that prioritizes ethics and values. They should communicate and reinforce ethical standards, expectations, and values throughout the organization.
2. Leading by example: Management should model ethical behaviour and integrity in their actions and decision-making processes. Employees look to their leaders for guidance and will often emulate their behaviour.
3. Promoting transparency and accountability: Management should foster an environment where transparency is encouraged, and individuals are held accountable for their actions. This includes promoting open communication channels, addressing unethical behaviour promptly, and taking appropriate disciplinary action when necessary.
4. Encouraging ethical decision-making: Management should provide employees with the necessary tools, resources, and training to make ethical decisions. This includes promoting ethical awareness and ensuring employees understand the organization's ethical standards and policies.
5. Rewarding ethical behaviour: Management should recognize and reward employees who demonstrate ethical behaviour and integrity. This can be done through various means such as performance evaluations, promotions, bonuses, or public acknowledgment.

##### **4.2 Stakeholder Theory and Management Ethics:**

Stakeholder theory<sup>12</sup> emphasizes that organizations have ethical responsibilities not only toward their shareholders but also toward other stakeholders who are affected by their actions. Here are some ethical responsibilities of management based on stakeholder theory:

---

<sup>11</sup>Workforce Africa, *Leadership and Organizational Culture*, LINKED IN, (8, June 2022),available at: <https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/leadership-organizational-culture-workforceafricake#:~:text=Ethical%20leadership%20helps%20businesses%20succeed,collaborative%20and%20trustworthy%20work%20environment>.

<sup>12</sup> Chris MacDonald and Alexei Marcoux, *Stakeholder*, CEBE CONCISE ENCYCLOPEDIA OF BUSINESS ETHICS, available at: <https://conciseencyclopedia.org/entries/stakeholder/#:~:text=Stakeholder%20theory%20is%20a%20point,the%20conduct%20of%20its%20business>.

1. Identifying stakeholders: Management should identify and consider the interests and needs of all stakeholders who may be affected by the organization's actions. This includes employees, customers, suppliers, communities, and the environment.
2. Balancing stakeholder interests: Management should strive to find a balance between the interests of different stakeholders. This may involve making decisions that consider the long-term well-being of all stakeholders rather than prioritizing short-term gains for a few.
3. Stakeholder engagement: Management should actively engage with stakeholders and seek their input and feedback. This can be done through regular communication, surveys, focus groups, or stakeholder advisory panels. This engagement helps ensure that the organization's decisions align with stakeholder expectations and values.
4. Responsible use of resources: Management has an ethical responsibility to ensure the responsible use of resources, including minimizing waste, reducing environmental impact, and promoting sustainable practices. This involves considering the long-term consequences of business operations on the environment and society.
5. Honouring commitments: Management should fulfil commitments made to stakeholders, including promises made to employees, customers, and the community. This includes honouring contractual agreements, providing a safe and fair working environment, and delivering high-quality products and services.

### 4.3 Ethical Decision-Making in Management:

Ethical decision-making<sup>13</sup> is a crucial aspect of management responsibilities. Managers often encounter situations where ethical considerations come into play. Here are some important aspects of ethical decision-making in management<sup>14</sup>:

1. Recognizing ethical dilemmas: Managers should be able to identify situations where there is a conflict between different ethical principles or values. They need to be aware of potential ethical dilemmas and understand the potential impact of their decisions on various stakeholders.
2. Gathering relevant information: Managers should gather all relevant information before making a decision. This includes understanding the facts, considering the perspectives of different stakeholders, and evaluating the potential consequences of various courses of action.
3. Evaluating options: Managers should consider various options and evaluate their potential ethical implications. They should assess the potential impact on stakeholders, identify potential risks, and weigh the ethical and moral considerations associated with each option.
4. Applying ethical frameworks: Managers can utilize ethical frameworks, such as utilitarianism, deontology, or virtue ethics, to analyse and guide their decision-making process.

<sup>13</sup> Caroline Forsey, *How to Practice Ethical Decision Making at Work*, HUB SPOT, (21, August 2018), available at: <https://blog.hubspot.com/marketing/ethical-decision-making>.

<sup>14</sup> Wayne Elsey, *Three Key Principles to Guide Ethical Decision-Making in The Digital Era*, FORBES, (7, February 2022), available at: <https://www.forbes.com/sites/forbesbusinessdevelopmentcouncil/2022/02/07/three-key-principles-to-guide-ethical-decision-making-in-the-digital-era/?sh=6d0bce795900>.

## **5. Comparative Analysis of Shareholder's Ethics and Management Ethics**

### **5.1 Ethical Decision-Making Processes:**

Both shareholders and management need to engage in ethical decision-making processes, but their perspectives and roles in the organization may differ<sup>15</sup>.

#### *Shareholders:*

- a) Shareholders typically make ethical decisions based on their financial interests and long-term goals for the company.
- b) They may consider factors such as maximizing shareholder value, evaluating the financial implications of ethical decisions, and ensuring transparency in corporate governance.
- c) Shareholders may exercise their ethical decision-making power through voting on resolutions, electing directors, and participating in shareholder meetings.

#### *Management:*

- a) Management is responsible for the day-to-day operations of the company and is often involved in making ethical decisions that impact various stakeholders.
- b) They need to consider the company's mission, values, and ethical guidelines when making decisions.
- c) Management may have to balance the interests of different stakeholders, such as employees, customers, and the broader community while making ethical choices.
- d) In summary, shareholders' ethical decision-making processes are primarily driven by financial considerations, while management's processes are more comprehensive, taking into account the company's mission, values, and the interests of multiple stakeholders.

### **5.2 Accountability and Responsibility:**

Shareholders and management both have accountability and responsibility in ensuring ethical conduct within an organization.

#### *Shareholders:*

- a) Shareholders hold management accountable for ethical behaviour through mechanisms such as voting, proxy resolutions, and engaging in shareholder activism.
- b) They have the responsibility to monitor the company's performance, financial reporting, and adherence to legal and ethical standards.
- c) Shareholders can exert influence on management by using their voting power to elect directors who align with their ethical expectations.

---

<sup>15</sup>Osmand Vitez, *What is the Relationship Between Business Ethics and Corporate Governance?* SMART CAPITAL MIND, (22, May 2023), available at: <https://www.smartcapitalmind.com/what-is-the-relationship-between-business-ethics-and-corporate-governance.htm>.

*Management:*

- a) Management has a direct responsibility to ensure ethical conduct throughout the organization.
- b) They establish ethical guidelines, codes of conduct, and compliance programs to promote and enforce ethical behaviour.
- c) Managers are accountable to the shareholders and other stakeholders for the company's performance, adherence to ethical standards, and addressing any ethical breaches or misconduct.

Both shareholders and management share the responsibility of upholding ethical standards within the organization, but management has a more direct role in establishing and enforcing ethical guidelines.

**5.3 Conflict of Interest:**

Conflicts of interest can arise for both shareholders and management, potentially influencing their ethical decision-making.

*Shareholders:*

- a) Shareholders may face conflicts of interest when their personal financial interests conflict with the best interests of the company or other stakeholders.
- b) For example, a shareholder may vote in favour of a decision that benefits them financially but is detrimental to other stakeholders.

*Management:*

- a) Management may encounter conflicts of interest when their personal interests clash with their duty to act in the best interests of the company and its stakeholders.
- b) For instance, a manager may have personal financial interests in a business deal that could compromise their objective judgment.

Both shareholders and management need to navigate conflicts of interest carefully and act ethically by prioritizing the long-term well-being of the company and its stakeholders.

**5.4 Alignment of Ethical Goals:**

Shareholders and management should strive for alignment in their ethical goals to ensure the long-term success and sustainability of the organization.

*Shareholders:*

- a) Shareholders may have a primary goal of maximizing financial returns on their investment.
- b) However, many shareholders also recognize the importance of responsible corporate citizenship, sustainability, and ethical business practices for the long-term success of the company.

- c) Shareholders can advocate for ethical behaviour, support resolutions that align with their values, and invest in companies that demonstrate strong ethical practices.

#### *Management:*

- a) Management plays a crucial role in aligning the company's ethical goals with the expectations of shareholders and other stakeholders.
- b) They are responsible for developing and implementing ethical policies, fostering a culture of integrity, and integrating ethical considerations into business strategies.
- c) Management should communicate the company's ethical goals and progress to shareholders to ensure transparency and accountability.
- d) When shareholders and management align their ethical goals, they can create a more sustainable and ethical business environment that benefits all stakeholders, including the shareholders themselves.

## **6. Case Studies: Examining Ethical Dilemmas in Shareholder-Management Interactions**

### **6.1 Enron Scandal: Shareholder and Management Ethical Failures**

The Enron scandal<sup>16</sup> is one of the most notorious examples of ethical failures in shareholder-management interactions. Enron was an American energy company that filed for bankruptcy in 2001, resulting in significant losses for shareholders and employees. The scandal involved fraudulent accounting practices, manipulation of financial statements, and deceptive business strategies.

Ethical dilemmas arose in the relationship between Enron's shareholders and management in several ways:

1. Conflict of Interest: Enron executives, including CEO Jeffrey Skilling and CFO Andrew Fastow, created complex financial structures to hide debt and inflate profits. These executives were motivated by personal financial gain, often at the expense of shareholders and employees. Their actions reflected a clear conflict of interest, as they prioritized their own interests over those of the shareholders.
2. Lack of Transparency: Enron's management deliberately concealed financial information from shareholders and the public. They used off-balance-sheet entities to keep debt off the company's financial statements, making Enron appear financially healthy when it was not. By withholding critical information, management violated the principle of transparency and prevented shareholders from making informed decisions.
3. Accounting Manipulation: Enron manipulated its financial statements through complex accounting techniques. This manipulation involved inflating revenue, understating debt, and

<sup>16</sup> Troy Segal, *Enron Scandal: The Fall of a Wall Street Darling*, INVESTPEDIA, (05, April 2023), available at: <https://www.investopedia.com/updates/enron-scandal-summary/>.

artificially boosting profits. These unethical practices misled shareholders and analysts, leading them to make inaccurate assessments of the company's financial health.

4. **Board Oversight Failure:** Enron's board of directors failed to provide effective oversight of management's actions. The board, which is responsible for representing shareholder interests, did not exercise due diligence in monitoring the company's financial practices. This failure allowed unethical behavior to persist and contributed to the scandal.
5. **Failure of Auditors:** The accounting firm Arthur Andersen, responsible for auditing Enron's financial statements, failed to detect the fraudulent practices. Andersen faced accusations of shredding documents related to Enron's audit, which further undermined their credibility. The failure of auditors to act ethically and fulfil their responsibilities contributed to the scandal.

The Enron scandal highlighted the importance of ethical conduct in shareholder-management interactions. It exposed the need for stronger corporate governance, increased transparency, and improved accountability. The scandal also led to significant reforms in accounting and corporate practices, such as the Sarbanes-Oxley Act of 2002, aimed at preventing similar ethical failures in the future.

## 6.2 Volkswagen Emissions Scandal: Ethical Implications for Shareholders and Management.

The Volkswagen emissions scandal<sup>17</sup>, also known as "Diesel gate," refers to the revelation in 2015 that Volkswagen had installed software in their diesel vehicles to manipulate emissions tests and deceive regulators. This scandal had significant ethical implications for both shareholders and management. Let's explore these implications in more detail:

### Shareholders:

- a) **Loss of trust:** Shareholders faced a severe loss of trust in Volkswagen. The scandal exposed the company's unethical behaviour, which damaged its reputation and led to a decline in stock prices. Shareholders who were unaware of the wrongdoing suffered financial losses.
- b) **Legal and financial consequences:** The scandal resulted in numerous lawsuits, settlements, and fines imposed on Volkswagen. Shareholders may have faced financial losses due to the decline in the company's market value and the costs associated with legal battles and compensating affected parties.
- c) **Reputational damage:** Volkswagen's tarnished reputation affected its ability to attract new investors and retain existing shareholders. The scandal raised doubts about the company's governance practices and commitment to ethical conduct.

<sup>17</sup>Jeffrey Rothfeder, *The Volkswagen Settlement: How Bad Management Leads to Big Punishment*, THE NEW YORKER, (01,July 2016), available at: <https://www.newyorker.com/business/currency/the-volkswagen-settlement-how-bad-management-leads-to-big-punishment>.



### *Management:*

Ethical responsibility: The scandal raised questions about the ethical conduct of Volkswagen's management. It revealed a culture where deceptive practices were allowed to take place. Management was responsible for creating and maintaining an environment that allowed such unethical behaviour to occur.

- a) Breach of trust: Management's involvement or knowledge of the emissions manipulation damaged the trust of employees, stakeholders, and the public. It eroded confidence in their ability to lead the company with integrity.
- b) Legal and regulatory consequences: Management faced legal repercussions, including investigations, lawsuits, and potential criminal charges. The scandal also led to significant regulatory scrutiny, resulting in fines and penalties for the company.
- c) Corporate governance issues: The scandal highlighted shortcomings in Volkswagen's corporate governance practices. It raised concerns about the effectiveness of internal controls, oversight mechanisms, and transparency within the company.

Overall, the Volkswagen emissions scandal had far-reaching ethical implications for both shareholders and management. Shareholders faced financial losses, reputational damage, and a loss of trust in the company. Management faced legal, financial, and reputational consequences, along with questions about their ethical responsibility and leadership. The scandal underscored the importance of strong corporate governance, ethical decision-making, and transparency in ensuring the long-term sustainability and trustworthiness of a company.

### **6.3 Patagonia: A Case of Ethical Alignment Between Shareholders and Management**

Patagonia<sup>18</sup> is a well-known outdoor clothing and gear company that has gained recognition for its commitment to environmental and social responsibility. It is often cited as a case study for ethical alignment between shareholders and management.

One of the key aspects of Patagonia's success in aligning shareholder and management interests is its clear and well-communicated mission and values. Patagonia's mission statement is "to build the best product, cause no unnecessary harm, and use business to inspire and implement solutions to the environmental crisis." This mission sets the tone for the company's actions and decisions, and it serves as a guiding principle for both shareholders and management.

Patagonia's founder, Yvon Chouinard, has been instrumental in instilling and maintaining the company's ethical alignment. He has been vocal about his personal values and has made it a priority to integrate

<sup>18</sup>Dr. Jason Wingard, *The Patagonia Model: CEOs Redefine Shareholder Value*, FORBES, (23, August 2019), available at: <https://www.forbes.com/sites/jasonwingard/2019/08/23/the-patagonia-model-ceos-redefine-shareholder-value/?sh=5dfd38a316e3>.

those values into Patagonia's business practices. Chouinard believes that doing good for the planet and society can also be good for business in the long run.

One example of Patagonia's ethical alignment is its commitment to environmental sustainability. The company has taken numerous steps to minimize its environmental footprint, such as using recycled materials, implementing responsible manufacturing processes, and advocating for sustainable practices throughout its supply chain. These actions resonate with both shareholders and management who share a common concern for the environment.

Another aspect of Patagonia's ethical alignment is its dedication to corporate social responsibility. The company actively engages in various social initiatives, including supporting grassroots environmental organizations, promoting fair labour practices, and advocating for policy changes that benefit the planet. By addressing social issues and promoting positive change, Patagonia attracts shareholders who are aligned with its values and encourages management to prioritize social impact alongside financial performance.

Patagonia's transparency and accountability are also crucial in maintaining ethical alignment. The company regularly communicates with its stakeholders, sharing information about its environmental and social initiatives, challenges faced, and progress made. This transparency fosters trust and allows shareholders to understand and support the company's actions, creating a sense of alignment between shareholders and management.

The success of Patagonia's ethical alignment is evident in its financial performance. Despite prioritizing sustainability and social impact, the company has achieved consistent growth and profitability. This demonstrates that ethical practices and financial success are not mutually exclusive, and can, in fact, reinforce each other.

In conclusion, Patagonia serves as a compelling case of ethical alignment between shareholders and management. By establishing a clear mission and values, embodying those values through concrete actions, promoting transparency and accountability, and achieving financial success alongside social and environmental impact, Patagonia has shown that a company can effectively align the interests of shareholders and management around ethical principles.

## **7. Ethical Best Practices for Shareholders and Management**

### **7.1 Developing Ethical Guidelines and Codes of Conduct:**

Developing clear and comprehensive ethical guidelines<sup>19</sup> and codes of conduct is essential for shareholders and management to establish a strong ethical foundation within the organization. These guidelines should outline the expected behaviour and ethical standards for all stakeholders, including shareholders, executives, managers, and employees. They should address issues such as conflicts of interest, fair competition, bribery and corruption, respect for human rights, environmental sustainability, and responsible governance. The guidelines and codes of conduct should be regularly reviewed, updated, and communicated to ensure everyone understands and complies with ethical expectations.

### **7.2 Promoting Ethical Awareness and Education:**

Promoting ethical awareness<sup>20</sup> and education is crucial for both shareholders and management. Regular training sessions, workshops, and seminars should be conducted to enhance understanding of ethical principles and dilemmas. This can include topics such as ethical decision-making, recognizing and addressing conflicts of interest, responsible use of company resources, respect for diversity and inclusion, and the importance of whistleblowing. Ethical awareness campaigns and communication channels should also be established to encourage open dialogue and create a culture of ethics throughout the organization.

### **7.3 Encouraging Transparency and Accountability:**

Transparency and accountability are fundamental to ethical practices. Shareholders and management should promote transparency by ensuring that relevant information is disclosed to stakeholders in a timely and accurate manner. This includes financial reporting, governance structures, executive compensation, and any other information that may impact stakeholders' decision-making. Additionally, mechanisms should be put in place to hold individuals accountable for their actions. This can involve implementing rigorous internal controls, conducting regular audits, and establishing independent oversight bodies. Encouraging a culture of accountability sends a clear message that unethical behaviour will not be tolerated.

By implementing these ethical best practices, shareholders and management can foster an environment that upholds integrity, trust, and responsible business practices. It demonstrates a commitment to ethical conduct, enhances the organization's reputation, and ultimately contributes to long-term sustainable success.

---

<sup>19</sup>Malcolm D Knight, Lessons from international corporate governance standards: the ethical perspective in corporate governance, BIS,(24, May 2005), available at: [https://www.bis.org/speeches/sp050524.htm?\\_\\_cf\\_chl\\_tk=mhz\\_cnst0mO.2eMRGPRjAwuRChxmlUs5ACZNFnTyLPA-1687004043-0-gaNycGzNCaU](https://www.bis.org/speeches/sp050524.htm?__cf_chl_tk=mhz_cnst0mO.2eMRGPRjAwuRChxmlUs5ACZNFnTyLPA-1687004043-0-gaNycGzNCaU).

<sup>20</sup>Gourav Vallabh, Gsarima Dadhich, *Corporate Governance and Ethical Compliance—Deriving Values from Indian Mythology*, SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH AN ACADEMIC PUBLISHER, (05, October 2016), available at: <https://www.scirp.org/journal/paperinformation.aspx?paperid=71361>.

## **8. Conclusion**

### **8.1 Summary of Findings:**

In this comparative study, we explored the ethical behaviour of shareholders and management in the corporate setting. The findings revealed several important insights:

1. **Shareholder Ethics:** Shareholders are primarily concerned with maximizing their financial returns on investment. They often prioritize short-term profits over long-term sustainability and may engage in activities such as insider trading or pushing for aggressive cost-cutting measures.
2. **Management Ethics:** Management is responsible for the overall functioning of the company and is expected to act in the best interests of the organization and its stakeholders. Ethical management practices involve transparency, accountability, and the promotion of long-term value creation. However, unethical practices such as bribery, fraud, or misrepresentation can occur.
3. **Conflicting Interests:** Shareholders and management often have conflicting interests due to their different roles and objectives. Shareholders focus on maximizing profits, while management is responsible for balancing multiple stakeholders' interests, including employees, customers, and the broader society.
4. **Ethical Dilemmas:** Both shareholders and management face ethical dilemmas in their decision-making processes. Shareholders may be tempted to prioritize short-term gains at the expense of long-term sustainability, while management may face pressure to engage in unethical practices to meet financial targets or appease shareholders.
5. **Importance of Ethical Leadership:** Ethical leadership plays a crucial role in setting the tone for the entire organization. When management demonstrates a strong commitment to ethical behaviour, it can positively influence shareholders and employees to act ethically as well.

### **8.2 Implications and Recommendations:**

Based on the findings, several implications and recommendations can be drawn:

1. **Stakeholder Engagement:** Companies should actively engage with shareholders to foster a deeper understanding of their interests and concerns. This can help align shareholder expectations with long-term sustainable business practices.
2. **Ethical Training:** Both shareholders and management should receive comprehensive ethical training to raise awareness about the importance of ethical behaviour and its impact on long-term business success. This can include training programs, workshops, and ongoing education initiatives.
3. **Transparent Reporting:** Companies should strive for transparency in reporting financial performance, risks, and corporate governance practices. This helps build trust among shareholders and promotes ethical decision-making by management.
4. **Ethical Incentives:** Companies can consider implementing incentive structures that reward ethical behaviour. This can help align shareholder and management interests by linking financial rewards to long-term sustainability rather than short-term gains.

### 8.3 Future Research Directions:

1. While this study provides valuable insights, there are several avenues for future research:
2. **Comparative Analysis:** Further comparative studies can explore the ethical behaviour of shareholders and management across different industries, company sizes, and cultural contexts. This can help identify variations and patterns in ethical practices.
3. **Longitudinal Studies:** Long-term studies can be conducted to examine the impact of shareholder and management ethics on organizational performance and sustainability over time. This can provide a more comprehensive understanding of the relationship between ethics and business outcomes.
4. **Ethical Leadership:** Future research can delve deeper into the role of ethical leadership in shaping shareholder and management ethics. Investigating the characteristics and behaviours of ethical leaders can help develop effective leadership strategies for promoting ethical behaviour in organizations.
5. **Legal and Regulatory Frameworks:** Studying the effectiveness of legal and regulatory frameworks in promoting ethical behaviour can provide insights into the role of external factors in shaping shareholder and management ethics.
6. Overall, this comparative study highlights the importance of ethical behaviour in both shareholders and management. By fostering a culture of ethics and aligning interests, companies can enhance long-term sustainability and create value for all stakeholders involved.

