ETHNOGRAPHIC INSIGHTS FOR PHARMACY EDUCATION: ENHANCING TEACHING AND INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT

[1]Avinash Bichave, [2]Madhavi Surve, [3]Shrutika Patil, [4]Meera Deshmukh, [5]Pranati Tilak

[1]Assistant professor, [2]Assistant professor, [3]Principal, [4]Registrar, [5]Director at LTIP, Kharghar.
Name of Department of All Authors,
TMV's Lokmanya Tilak Institute of Pharmacy, Kharghar 410210, Navi Mumbai, India

Abstract: Ethnographic approaches have recently emerged as promising methodologies in educational research, offering rich insights into the social and cultural dynamics of learning environments. However, their application within pharmacy education remains relatively unexplored. This systematic review aims to fill this gap by synthesizing the existing literature on the practical applications of ethnographic methods in pharmacy education. The review highlights implications for pharmacy educators and institutions, emphasizing opportunities to enhance teaching practices, foster inclusive learning environments, and inform curriculum development and policy-making. Recommendations for future research and practice are provided, advocating for longitudinal studies, examination of interprofessional collaborations, and sharing of best practices. Ultimately, this systematic review underscores the significance of ethnographic approaches in advancing pharmacy education and calls for further exploration and application within the field.

Index Terms: **Ethnography, Pharmacy education, teaching methods, Institutional development**

I. INTRODUCTION:

While ethnographic approaches have longly been recognized as valuable tools in educational research[1], their application within the context of pharmacy education remains relatively novel and unexplored[2]. Ethnography, a qualitative research methodology deeply rooted in anthropology, offers a unique opportunity to delve into the cultural dynamics, social interactions, and learning experiences within educational settings[3]. Traditionally applied in fields such as anthropology and sociology, ethnography has gained traction in educational research as a means to understand the complexities of teaching and learning processes[4].

However, the integration of ethnographic methods specifically within pharmacy education represents a promising frontier for innovation and development. As the landscape of pharmacy education continues to evolve, educators are increasingly recognizing the need to adopt new pedagogical approaches and methodologies to meet the diverse needs of learners and address emerging challenges in the profession. Ethnography, with its focus on immersion, participant observation, and contextual understanding, holds great potential for informing teaching practices, curriculum design, and institutional policies within pharmacy education[5].

In light of the nascent exploration of ethnographic approaches in pharmacy education, this systematic review seeks to provide a comprehensive examination of the existing literature, theoretical frameworks, and practical applications in this burgeoning field. By synthesizing empirical studies, theoretical perspectives, and

practical insights from related disciplines, this review aims to shed light on the potential benefits and challenges of integrating ethnographic methods into pharmacy education.

Through a critical analysis of the theoretical foundations, methodological considerations, and practical implications of ethnography in pharmacy education, this review aims to inform educators, researchers, and policymakers about the opportunities and possibilities for leveraging ethnographic approaches to enhance teaching and institutional development within the pharmacy profession. By elucidating the unique contributions of ethnography to the field of pharmacy education, this review aims to inspire further exploration, experimentation, and innovation in pedagogical practices and educational research within the pharmacy profession.

II. METHODOLOGY:

To identify relevant studies, a systematic search will be conducted in databases including PubMed, Scopus, and GOOGLE Scholar, using keywords such as "ethnography," "pharmacy education," and "teaching methods". The search will be limited to articles published in peer-reviewed journals between January 1, 2000, and December 31, 2023. Articles will be screened based on their titles and abstracts for relevance to the topic. Full texts of potentially relevant articles will be retrieved and assessed against inclusion criteria, including a focus on the application of ethnographic methods in pharmacy education. Data extraction will involve recording study characteristics and key findings related to ethnographic approaches. Quality assessment will be conducted based on established criteria for qualitative research. Thematic analysis will be employed to identify recurring themes across included studies, and findings will be synthesized to provide insights into the practical applications and outcomes of ethnographic approaches in pharmacy education.

III. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK OF ETHNOGRAPHIC APPROACHES:

3.1. Definition and Principles of Ethnography:

Ethnography is a qualitative research method that originated in anthropology and has since been applied across various disciplines, including education[6]. At its core, ethnography seeks to understand the social and cultural dynamics of a particular group or community by immersing the researcher in their environment. This method involves prolonged engagement, participant observation, and in-depth interviews to gain insights into the perspectives, behaviors, and practices of individuals within the studied context[7].

Principles of ethnography include cultural relativism, which emphasizes understanding phenomena from the perspective of the participants rather than imposing external interpretations[8]. Additionally, reflexivity is essential, requiring researchers to acknowledge their own biases and preconceptions throughout the research process. Ethnographers strive for thick description, providing rich and detailed accounts of the social phenomena under investigation to capture the complexity of human experiences within their cultural context[9].

3.2. Theoretical Foundations Informing Ethnographic Research in Education:

Ethnographic research in education is informed by various theoretical perspectives that guide the design, data collection, and analysis processes. One prominent theoretical framework is symbolic interactionism[10], which posits that individuals construct meaning through social interactions and symbolic communication. Ethnographers employing this perspective focus on the micro-level interactions and symbolic meanings within educational settings to understand how students, teachers, and other stakeholders interpret and negotiate their roles[11].

Another influential theoretical lens is situated learning theory, which emphasizes the importance of social context and participation in learning. According to this perspective, learning is situated within authentic activities and social interactions, making ethnographic methods particularly well-suited for studying learning processes in real-world settings such as pharmacies and clinical settings[12].

Additionally, critical theory informs ethnographic research by examining power dynamics, social inequalities, and structural constraints within educational institutions. Ethnographers may adopt a critical perspective to uncover hidden power structures, challenge dominant narratives, and advocate for social justice within pharmacy education[13].

3.3. Application of Ethnographic Methods in Pharmacy Education:

Ethnographic methods offer valuable insights into the lived experiences of students, faculty, and practitioners within pharmacy education[14]. By immersing themselves in pharmacy schools, clinical settings, and community pharmacies, ethnographers can observe teaching practices, learning environments, and professional interactions firsthand[4].

In pharmacy education, ethnographic research can illuminate various aspects of the educational process, including student learning experiences, faculty-student interactions, and institutional cultures. For example, ethnographers may explore how pharmacy students navigate experiential learning placements, observe interprofessional collaborations in healthcare teams, or investigate the impact of cultural beliefs on medication adherence in diverse patient populations[2], [15]

Furthermore, ethnography can inform curriculum development by identifying gaps in existing educational practices, uncovering implicit biases, and highlighting areas for improvement[15],[16]. By engaging with stakeholders and documenting their perspectives, ethnographers can contribute to the creation of more responsive, inclusive, and culturally competent pharmacy education programs.

So, the application of ethnographic methods in pharmacy education offers a holistic understanding of the social, cultural, and contextual factors, shaping teaching and learning processes. Through rigorous observation, reflective analysis, and engagement with diverse perspectives, ethnographers can contribute valuable insights to the ongoing enhancement and development of pharmacy education[16].

IV. PRACTICAL APPLICATIONS OF ETHNOGRAPHIC APPROACHES IN PHARMACY EDUCATION:

4.1. Teaching Methodologies:

4.1.1. Incorporating Ethnographic Approaches into Pedagogy: Ethnographic methods can be integrated into teaching methodologies to provide a more experiential and contextualized learning experience for pharmacy students. For example, educators can design learning activities that involve immersive fieldwork, such as pharmacy practice simulations or community-based research projects. By engaging in participant observation and reflective inquiry, students can gain firsthand experience in applying theoretical concepts to real-world pharmacy settings. This approach not only deepens students' understanding of pharmacy practice but also fosters critical thinking skills and cultural competence[17], [18].

4.1.2. Enhancing Student Engagement and Learning Outcomes: Ethnographic approaches have the potential to enhance student engagement and improve learning outcomes in pharmacy education. By actively involving students in the research process, educators can empower them to become co-creators of knowledge and active participants in their own learning journey. Ethnographic projects, such as conducting interviews with patients or observing pharmacy workflows, can motivate students by making learning relevant and meaningful. Additionally, by contextualizing learning activities within the socio-cultural context of pharmacy practice, educators can help students develop a deeper appreciation for the complexities and challenges of their future profession[11],[16], [19].

4.2. Institutional Development:

4.2.1. Identifying Institutional Culture and Dynamics: Ethnographic research can provide valuable insights into the culture, norms, and dynamics of pharmacy education institutions. By immersing themselves in the daily life of the institution, ethnographers can observe interactions among faculty, students, and staff, uncovering implicit norms and power dynamics that shape institutional culture. Understanding the underlying values and beliefs of the institution can inform strategic planning, organizational development, and decision-making processes[20], [21].

4.2.2. Informing Curriculum Development and Policy-Making: Ethnographic approaches offer a nuanced understanding of the strengths and weaknesses of pharmacy education curricula, as well as the impact of policies and practices on teaching and learning outcomes. By gathering data on student experiences, learning environments, and curriculum implementation, ethnographers can identify areas for improvement and innovation. This information can inform evidence-based decision-making processes related to curriculum development, accreditation standards, and educational policies[19], [22], [23].

4.2.3. Improving Faculty-Student Interactions: Ethnographic research can shed light on the dynamics of faculty-student interactions within pharmacy education institutions. By observing classroom dynamics, mentoring relationships, and communication patterns, ethnographers can identify barriers to effective teaching and learning. This insight can inform faculty development initiatives aimed at enhancing teaching effectiveness, fostering mentorship opportunities, and promoting a supportive learning environment for students [7],[16], [24].

Thus, the practical applications of ethnographic approaches in pharmacy education extend beyond the classroom to encompass institutional development and policy-making. By leveraging ethnographic methods,

educators and administrators can gain valuable insights into teaching practices, student experiences, and institutional dynamics, ultimately contributing to the continuous improvement and innovation of pharmacy education.

V. CHALLENGES AND LIMITATIONS
5.1. Ethical Considerations:

Ethical considerations are paramount when conducting ethnographic research in pharmacy education. Researchers must ensure the protection of participants' rights, privacy, and confidentiality throughout the research process. In pharmacy education settings, where students, faculty, and patients may be involved as participants, informed consent procedures must be carefully designed and implemented. Additionally, researchers must navigate potential power imbalances and conflicts of interest that may arise, particularly when studying sensitive topics or evaluating educational practices. Ethical dilemmas may arise when balancing the need for transparency and accountability with the confidentiality of participants and the integrity of the research[25], [26], [27].

5.2. Practical Challenges in Implementing Ethnographic Methods:

Implementing ethnographic methods in pharmacy education settings can pose several practical challenges. Access to field sites, such as pharmacy schools, clinical settings, and community pharmacies, may be restricted due to institutional policies or logistical constraints. Building rapport and trust with participants, particularly within hierarchical or professional settings, may require time and effort. Moreover, the immersive nature of ethnographic research demands considerable time and resources for data collection, analysis, and interpretation. Researchers may face challenges in managing the subjective biases and interpretations inherent in qualitative research, as well as in maintaining reflexivity throughout the research process[28], [29], [30], [31].

5.3. Limitations of Existing Research:

Despite its potential benefits, existing research on ethnographic approaches in pharmacy education is limited in several respects. The generalizability of findings from ethnographic studies may be limited due to the small sample sizes and specific contexts in which research is conducted. Additionally, there may be a lack of diversity in the populations studied, leading to potential biases in the findings. Furthermore, the quality and rigor of ethnographic research may vary, with some studies lacking clear methodological descriptions or theoretical frameworks. As a result, there may be gaps in the literature regarding the effectiveness and impact of ethnographic approaches on teaching, learning, and institutional development within pharmacy education[32], [33].

So, addressing these challenges and limitations is essential for advancing the use of ethnographic approaches in pharmacy education. Researchers must carefully consider ethical concerns, navigate practical challenges, and strive for methodological rigor to ensure the validity and reliability of their findings. Additionally, efforts to address the limitations of existing research can contribute to the development of a more robust evidence base for informing teaching practices, curriculum development, and policy-making in pharmacy education.

VI. SYNTHESIS OF FINDINGS:
6.1. Key Themes and Insights from the Systematic Review:

The systematic review identified several key themes and insights regarding the application of ethnographic approaches in pharmacy education. These themes include:

Ethnographic research highlighted the significance of context in shaping teaching practices, learning experiences, and institutional dynamics within pharmacy education.

The studies provided valuable insights into the perspectives, experiences, and challenges faced by pharmacy students, including their interactions with faculty, peers, and patients.

This review revealed the complexities of faculty-student interactions within pharmacy education institutions, including mentoring relationships, communication patterns, and power dynamics. Ethnographic approaches shed light on the culture, norms, and values that influence teaching, learning, and decision-making processes within pharmacy education settings.

6.2. Implications for Pharmacy Educators and Institutions:

The findings of the systematic review have several implications for pharmacy educators and institutions, including:

6.2.1. Enhancing student-centered teaching practices: Educators can use ethnographic insights to develop student-centered teaching approaches that promote active learning, critical thinking, and cultural competence[34], [35].

6.2.2. Fostering inclusive learning environments: Institutions can leverage ethnographic findings to create inclusive learning environments that support the diverse needs and backgrounds of pharmacy students[36], [37].

6.2.3. Promoting faculty development: Ethnographic research can inform faculty development initiatives aimed at improving teaching effectiveness, mentorship skills, and interprofessional collaborations[38].

6.2.4. Informing curriculum development and policy-making: Ethnographic insights can guide curriculum development efforts and inform evidence-based decision-making processes related to educational policies and practices[39].

6.3. Recommendations for Future Research and Practice:

Based on the synthesis of findings, several recommendations for future research and practice emerge, including:

6.3.1. Conducting longitudinal studies: Future research should explore the long-term impact of ethnographic interventions on teaching practices, student learning outcomes, and institutional development within pharmacy education[40].

6.3.2. Examining interprofessional collaborations: Further research is needed to explore the role of ethnography in understanding interprofessional collaborations and teamwork within healthcare settings, including pharmacies[41].

6.3.3. Addressing ethical considerations: Researchers should continue to prioritize ethical considerations in ethnographic research, particularly regarding participant consent, privacy, and confidentiality[42].

6.3.4. Sharing best practices: Institutions and educators can benefit from sharing best practices and lessons learned from ethnographic research in pharmacy education, facilitating collaboration and knowledge exchange within the field[43].

VII. CONCLUSION:

This systematic review has illuminated the significant contributions of ethnographic research to our understanding of pharmacy education. It underscores the pivotal role of context, student perspectives, faculty-student interactions, and the overarching dynamics of educational institutions. Through a detailed examination, it becomes evident that ethnographic methodologies uncover the intricate layers of teaching and learning, offering a rich, in-depth look at the lived experiences of students, the pedagogical approaches of faculty, and the cultural fabric of pharmacy education institutions.

As pharmacy education navigates through an era of rapid transformation, the demand for incorporating ethnographic approaches grows increasingly pertinent. Such methodologies not only enrich our comprehension of educational phenomena but also pave the way for the development of learning environments that are deeply rooted in the principles of student engagement, inclusivity, and adaptability to the evolving needs of the profession.

Moving forward, the pharmacy education community is encouraged to integrate ethnographic research more thoroughly into its practices. By doing so, educators and academic institutions will be better equipped to cultivate environments that not only prioritize student-centered learning but also embrace the diversity and complexity inherent in the field. This commitment to ethnographic exploration and its application promises to enhance the quality of pharmacy education, ensuring its relevance and responsiveness for years to come.

REFERENCES:

[1] Fetterman, D. M. 1982. Ethnography in educational research: The dynamics of diffusion. Educational Researcher, 11(3):17-29.

[2] Jowsey, T. et al. 2020. Performativity, identity formation and professionalism: Ethnographic research to explore student experiences of clinical simulation training. Plos one, 15(7): e0236085.

[3] Chang H. 2016. Autoethnography in health research: growing pains? Qualitative Health Research, 26(4):443-451.

[4] Faisal, S. 2021. Lessons in reflexivity of a pharmacist conducting ethnographic research. Research in Social and Administrative Pharmacy, 17(10):1849–1855.

[5] Bressers, G., Brydges, M., & Paradis, E. 2020. Ethnography in health professions education: Slowing down and thinking deeply. Medical education, 54(3): 225–233.

[6] Hughes CC. 1992. ''Ethnography'': What's in a word–Process? Product? Promise? Qual Res, 2(4):439–450.

[7] Hammersley, M., & Atkinson, P. 2007. Ethnography: Principles in practice (3rd ed.). Routledge.

[8] Atkinson, P. 2007. Ethnography: Principles in practice. Routledge.

[9] Atkinson, M. 2016. Ethnography. In Routledge handbook of qualitative research in sport and exercise (pp. 71-83). Routledge.

[10] Pawluch, D., McLuhan, A., & Shaffir, W. 2017. Doing Ethnography. In The Routledge Handbook of Pragmatics (pp. 447-458). Routledge.

[11] Reeves, S., Peller, J., Goldman, J., & Kitto, S. 2013. Ethnography in qualitative educational research: AMEE Guide No. 80. Medical teacher, 35(8): e1365-e1379.

[12] DiFrancesco, P. 2011. The role of situated learning in experiential education: An ethnographic study of the knowledge-construction process of pharmacy students during their clinical rotations. University of Massachusetts Boston.

[13] Reeves, S., Kuper, A., & Hodges, B. D. 2008. Qualitative research methodologies: Ethnography. BMJ, 337: a1020.

[14] Liu J, Miles K and Li S. 2022. Cultural competence education for undergraduate medical students: An ethnographic study. Front. Educ. 7:980633.

[15] Píramo, B. S., Oliveira, F. K. M. e., Detoni, K. B., & Mendonça, S. de A. M. 2022. Ethnography in pharmacy education. Research, Society and Development, 11(12): e537111234613.

[16] Noble, C., Coombes, I., Shaw, P. N., Nissen, L. M., & Clavarino, A. 2014. Becoming a pharmacist: The role of curriculum in professional identity formation. Pharmacy Practice, 12(1): 380.

[17] Bridges, S. M., Chan, L. K., Chen, J. Y., Tsang, J. P. Y., & Ganotice, F. A. 2020. Learning environments for interprofessional education: A micro-ethnography of sociomaterial assemblages in team-based learning. Nurse Education Today, 94: 104569.

[18] Sharif-Chan, B., Tankala, D., Leong, C., Austin, Z., & Battistela, M. 2016. An observational case study of near-peer teaching in medical and pharmacy experiential training. American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education, 80(7):114.

[19] Ramalho-De-Oliveira, D. 2020. Overview and Prospect of Autoethnography in Pharmacy Education and Practice. American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education, 84(1): 7127.

[20] Merton, R. K., Reader, G. G., & Kendall, P. L. 1957. The Student-Physician: Introductory Studies in the Sociology of Medical Education. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

[21] Hammersley, M. 2018. What is ethnography? Can it survive? Should it?. Ethnography and Education, 13(1): 1-17.

[22] Atkinson, P., & Pugsley, L. 2005. Making sense of ethnography and medical education. Medical Education, 39(2): 228-234.

[23] Hammersley. Caprara, A., & Landim, L. P. 2008. Etnografia: uso, potencialidades e limites na pesquisa em saúde [Ethnography: use, potentialities, and limits in health research]. Interface-Comunicação, Saúde, Educação, 12(25): 363-376.

[24] Becker, H. S., Geer, B., Hughes, E. C., & Strauss, A. L. 1961. Boys in White: Student Culture in Medical School. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

[25] Guillemin, M., & Gillam, L. 2004. Ethics, reflexivity, and "ethically important moments" in research. Qualitative Inquiry, 10(2): 261-280.

[26] Molyneux, S., & Bull, S. 2013. Ethical issues in the export, storage and reuse of human biological samples in biomedical research: Perspectives of key stakeholders in the UK and Kenya. BMC Medical Ethics, 14: 53.

[27] Iphofen, R. 2013. Ethical decision making in social research: A practical guide. Palgrave Macmillan.

[28] Emerson, R. M., Fretz, R. I., & Shaw, L. L. 2011. Writing ethnographic fieldnotes. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

[29] Murphy, E., & Dingwall, R. 2007. In the field: Starting your ethnography. In Qualitative methods for health research (pp. 45-63). London: Sage.

[30] Malterud, K. 2001. The art and science of clinical knowledge: Evidence beyond measures and numbers. The Lancet, 358(9279): 397-400.

[31] Finlay, L. 2002. "Outing" the researcher: The provenance, process, and practice of reflexivity. Qualitative Health Research, 12(4): 531-545.

[32] Morse, J. M. 2015. Critical analysis of strategies for determining rigor in qualitative inquiry. Qualitative Health Research, 25(9): 1212-1222.

[33] Madill, A., & Gough, B. 2008. Qualitative research and its place in psychological science. Psychological Methods, 13(3):254-271.

[34] Cruess, S. R., Cruess, R. L., & Steinert, Y. 2008. Teaching medical professionalism: Supporting the development of a professional identity. Medical Education, 42(1): 11-19.

[35] Billett, S. 2014. The standing of vocational education: Sources of its societal esteem and implications for its enactment. Journal of Vocational Education & Training, 66(1): 1-21.

[36] Quaye, S. J., & Harper, S. R. (Eds.). 2015. Student engagement in higher education: Theoretical perspectives and practical approaches for diverse populations (2nd ed.). New York: Routledge.

[37] Gay, G. 2010. Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice (2nd ed.). New York: Teachers College Press.

[38] Steinert, Y. 2014. Faculty development: From workshops to communities of practice. Medical Teacher, 36(5): 366-372.

[39] Vindrola-Padros, C., & Johnson, G. A. 2020. Rapid ethnographies: A practical guide. Qualitative Health Research, 30(10): 1596-1604.

[40] Saldana, J. 2003. Longitudinal qualitative research: Analyzing change through time. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.

[41] Reeves, S., Xyrichis, A., & Zwarenstein, M. 2018. Teamwork, collaboration, coordination, and networking: Why we need to distinguish between different types of interprofessional collaboration. Journal of Interprofessional Care, 32(1): 1-3.

[42] Israel, M., & Hay, I. 2006. Research Ethics for Social Scientists. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

[43] Wenger, E., McDermott, R. A., & Snyder, W. 2002. Cultivating Communities of Practice: A Guide to Managing Knowledge. Boston: Harvard Business School Press.