

A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF PATIENTS SATISFACTION LEVEL IN GOVERNMENT AND PRIVATE HOSPITALS OF DISTRICT GAUTAM BUDHA NAGAR (NOIDA)

Dr. Rekha Sharma
Principal/Head
Kalka Group of Institutions, Meerut (U.P)

Neeraj Kumar Sharma
(Research Scholar, Mewar University)
Assist. Professor
Aligarh Institute of Management and
Technology, Aligarh (U.P), India

ABSTRACT: Health is an essential component of nation's development and is vital to the economy growth and internal stability of the country. Currently, healthcare is one of India's largest service industries, in terms of revenue and employment. In the normal practice of health care institutions, generally the senior doctors administrate and manage all the departments of a health care unit. But in the present era of multinational health care institutions, it is being accepted that hospital management is a full time job and is entirely different from medico profession. So the managerial professional should perform such functions. For the purpose of systematic management of healthcare units, a new branch of management named, hospital management has come into existence in the global arena. Private hospitals are spending more than 80 percent of the total healthcare expenditure and are quite dominant in the healthcare sector. Inadequate public investment in health infrastructure has given an opportunity to private hospitals to capture a large share of the market, for the growth and development of hospital industry may be a private or government healthcare unit, there is a need to identify, the factors which increase the satisfaction level of the patients of the hospital because the staff of the hospital & their interface with the patients decides the impression and latter carry with them about the hospital where they were treated in. It will decide whether they would like to return to the same hospital wherever the need arises. It is believed that the result of the study would attract the attention of government, medicine institutions, Hospital administrators and management, that they all would be encouraged to make their whole hearted efforts to bring a new revolution in the field of hospital management in the country as a whole and district Gautam Budha Nagar (Noida) in specific.

INTRODUCTION

It is an old saying that customers are real evaluator of any organization. Evaluation of any organization may be judged through the perception of its customers. Here, perception means the level of satisfaction of customers after availing the services of the hospitals. In case of hospitals patient satisfaction level determines the success of any particular health care unit. It is generally based on personal experience, word of mouth publicity or authentic information received by a close person. The satisfaction of patients of hospital in terms of quality of services provided by a healthcare unit depends upon a number of factors such as timeliness, efficiency, a authentic & genuine treatment of illness, reasonable fees structure, respect & caring, safety etc. The satisfaction level of patients of a hospital also depends upon the attitude of healthcare service provider and the environment of the hospitals.

PURPOSE OF THE STUDY

This paper aims to explore the patient satisfaction level with access to treatment in both the private and government hospitals at Gautam Budh Nagar (Noida). This study also focused on the concept of hospital management because in the present scenario of India the multinational healthcare institutions taking a lead in healthcare industry, it is being accepted that hospital management is a full time job and is entirely different from medico profession. So the managerial professional should perform such functions.

OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

- To study the concept of hospital management and its importance in healthcare market in India as a whole and district Gautam Budha Nagar (Noida) in specific.
- To conduct a comparative study of patients satisfaction level in government and private hospitals in district Gautam Budha Nagar (Noida) in specific.
- To draw logical conclusion and to give constructive suggestions.

LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

There are number of limitations regarding the present research study -

- **Limitation Regarding Data Collection:** Data collection is the most difficult task to achieve. We met personally to the officials of the hospitals and had to face their attitude and behaviour. Even initially the doctors and employees of hospitals did not show any interest in providing any data and information for the purpose of the research study.
- **Limitations Regarding Personal Interview:** While conducting personal interviews the difficulty, which came was that firstly most of the interviewees did not give any positive response. But after making repeated efforts we got success in getting the required information by convincing them.
- **Limitations Regarding the Availability of Literature:** For the purpose of this research study we faced a great difficulty in searching the matter related to the study.
- **Limitations Regarding Shortage of Time.**

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

According to Feras Alkaa (2011) he conducted a research to study the healthcare units and study the quality of patient satisfaction and patient trust. It also aims to test the socio demographic variables in determining healthcare quality. On the other hand the study indicated better quality in private hospitals compared to public hospitals.

In healthcare units, the patients satisfaction level is considered to be the major indicator in order to assess the service quality of a healthcare organization (Cronin & Taylor, 1992; Connor et al., 1994). It means that customer satisfaction is the major device for critical decision making in selecting a healthcare services (Gilbert et al., 1992) and quality of services delivered to the customers should meet their perceptions (Parasuraman et al., 1985, 1988; Reidenbach & Sandifer-Smallwood, 1990; Babakus & Mangold, 1992; Zeithaml et al., 1993).

Rajendran et al. (2010), identifies that patients and attendants treat the interpersonal aspect of care as the most important one, as they cannot fully evaluate the technical quality of healthcare services. The study also revealed that the hospital service providers have to understand the needs of both patients and attendants in order to gather a holistic view of their services.

Sharmila (2013), study indicates that service quality in private hospitals is meeting patients satisfactions and private hospitals are delivering better healthcare services in comparison to government hospitals. The result can be used by the hospitals to reengineer and redesign creatively their quality management processes and the future direction of their more effective healthcare quality strategies.

(Nandaraj and Manjunath et al., 2007) as per their study to improve the quality services of the hospitals, the accreditation certification process is must and it provides international recognition and guaranteed quality to healthcare units apart from this it not only give care and protection to the patients but also improve quality and attract the new markets.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

To conduct the proposed research study, the Exploratory Research Design, Purposive Convenience Sampling, Simple Random Sampling and field study method is used.

SCOPE OF THE STUDY

Area	Extent
Theoretical/Conceptual scope	A Comparative Study of Patients Satisfaction Level in Government And Private Hospital of District Gautam Budh Nagar (Noida)
Regional /Survey Area	Gautam Budh Nagar (Noida) Private & Government Hospitals
Selected Hospital	6 leading private hospitals and 06 government hospital were taken in the study. The names and details of the hospital are as follows- PRIVATE HOSPITALS AT NOIDA: (Fortis Hospital, Noida Sector-62, Apollo Hospital Noida Sector- 15, MAX Hospital Noida Sector-19, Kailash Hospital Noida Sector-17, Jaypee Medical Centre Noida Sector-128, Prakash Hospital Noida Sector-17) GOVERNMENT HOSPITALS AT NOIDA: (Dr. Bheem Rao Ambedker Hospital Sector-30, ESI Hospital Sector-24, Noida Medical Centre Sector-30, Air Force Hospital Sector-25, Indraprashtha Medical Corporation Ltd. Sector-26, Indo Gulf Diagnostics and Research Centre Noida Sector-19)
Sample Size	From 300 patients and their attendants the information is collected through questionnaire

HYPOTHESIS OF THE STUDY

The study is based on the following hypothesis -

- To study the increasing competition in healthcare market in India, Government as well as private sector hospitals have a need to accept & adopt the concept of hospital management.
- Generally the patients of government hospitals are not satisfied with the services of the hospitals.

DATA ANALYSIS

In the present study the researcher made an effort to present a comparative study of level of patient's satisfaction in Government and Private sector hospitals. This study has been completed with a belief that the results of the study would represent the true status of patient satisfaction level in government and private sector hospitals of the state for the purpose of analyzing patients satisfaction level, researcher personally interviewed 300 patients (150 each from the both categories of hospitals) admitted in the government and private sector hospitals of district Gautam Budha Nagar (Noida). During the period of study the analysis of satisfaction level of patients are analyzed with the following headings:-

- Satisfaction level of patients from the point of view of Organizational Environment.
- Satisfaction level of patients from the point of view of attitude of Hospital Administrators.
- Satisfaction level of patients from the point of view of behavioural approach of Hospital Staff.
- Satisfaction level of patients from the point of view of quality of services provided by the hospital.
- Satisfaction level of patients from the point of view of quality of facilities provided by the hospital.
- Satisfaction level of patients from the point of view of quality of charges taken by the hospital.

Table No – 1.1

Particulars	No. of Samples	Government Hospitals		Private Hospitals	
		Positive Reply	Negative Reply	Positive Reply	Negative Reply
		In Percentage		In Percentage	
Do you find the environment of hospital free from the different types of pollution?	150 from each category of hospitals	66	84	130	20
Do you find all the required departments in the hospital?		123	27	114	36
Do you feel proper coordination among different departments of the hospital?		33	117	135	15
Do you find the dealing employees in a position to take decisions freely according to situation?		21	129	111	39
Do you find the organizational culture of hospital patients' friendly?		NIL	150	117	33

Table No – 1.2

Particulars	No. of Samples	Government Hospitals		Private Hospitals	
		Positive Reply	Negative Reply	Positive Reply	Negative Reply
		In Percentage		In Percentage	
Did you find the attitude of hospital administrators commercial?	150 from each category of hospitals	NA	NA	141	9

Did you find the administrative authorities of hospital easily approachable?	45	105	100	50
Were all the terms & conditions of hospital clearly explained to you before admitted in the hospital?	NIL	150	NIL	150
Was the response of administration of hospital sympathetic at the time of any complaint?	50	100	126	24
Did you observed the policies of hospital were patient oriented?	93	57	48	102

Table No – 1.3

Particulars	No. of Samples	Government Hos pitals		Private Hospi tals	
		Positi ve Reply	Negati ve Reply	Positi ve Reply	Negati ve Reply
		In Percentage		In Percentage	
Did you find the behaviour of registration clerk was polite & cordial?	150 from each category of hospitals	18	132	144	6
Did you find the behaviour of matron/ Nursing staff/ supporting staff polite and cordial?		60	90	135	15
Did you find the behaviour of attendant/sweepers polite and cordial?		30	120	147	3
Did you get 24 hrs. Prompt nursing services in the hospital?		27	123	150	NIL
Did you receive the medicines through your nurse most of the time?		NIL	150	150	NIL
Did you find overall behaviour approach of staff members of the ward satisfactory?		NIL	150	150	NIL
Did the visit of doctors remain prompt?		33	117	150	NIL

Table No – 1.4

Particulars	No. of Samples	Government Hos pitals		Private Hospi tals	
		Positi ve Reply	Negati ve Reply	Positi ve Reply	Negati ve Reply
		In Percentage		In Percentage	

Did you feel satisfied with the emergency Medicare services provided by the hospital?	150 from each category of hospitals	54	96	132	18
Did you feel satisfied with the facilities available in the ICU of the hospital?		30	120	140	10
Did you feel satisfied with the laboratory services provided by the hospital?		45	105	102	48
Did you feel satisfied with the Dietary services provided by the hospital?		24	126	108	42
Did you feel satisfied with the laundry services provided by the hospital?		24	126	144	6
Did you feel satisfied with the other in house services provided by the hospital?		NIL	150	120	30

Table No – 1.5

Particulars	No. of Samples	Government Hospitals		Private Hospitals	
		Positive Reply	Negative Reply	Positive Reply	Negative Reply
		In Percentage		In Percentage	
Did the water supply of hospital regular & hygienic?	150 from each category of hospitals	99	51	145	5
Did you feel the canteen Facilities available in the hospital is economic?		108	142	80	70
Did you find a well equipped pathology lab in the hospital?		15	135	54	96
Did you observed blood bank facility in the hospital?		50	100	21	129
Was the internal medical store of hospital perfect and economic?		NA	NA	72	93
Did you find banking & communication services facilities in the hospital?		30	120	135	15
Did hospital occupied proper parking place?		150	NIL	120	30

Table No – 1.6

Particulars	No. of Samples	Government Hospitals		Private Hospitals	
		Positive Reply	Negative Reply	Positive Reply	Negative Reply
		In Percentage		In Percentage	

Did you find the medico fees structure of hospital satisfactory?	150 from each category of hospitals	NA	NA	30	120
Did you find the room charges provided by the hospital satisfactory?		NA	NA	24	126
Did you noticed any hidden cost added by the hospital in your bill?		NA	NA	9	141
Did any employee expect any undue monetary benefit from the patients?		114	36	18	132
Was the billing system and cash counter facility of hospital in proper mode?		NA	NA	150	NIL
Did hospital provide you proper support in the completion of your Medi-claim papers?		20	130	144	6
Did you find the overall charges of the hospital genuine?		NA	NA	120	30

CONCLUSION

- The organizational structure of government and private sector hospitals are entirely different. The government hospitals are run by the State to provide curative as well as preventive medical aids primarily to the deprived section of society. These hospitals are completely funded by the government and have negligible internal financial resources. On the other hand private hospitals provide their services on commercial basis to those patients who are capable to pay their charges. Even charitable private hospitals operate their functioning on no profit no loss basis and depend upon fees and charges collected by the patients for their day to day financial requirements.
- Organizational structure of government sector and public sector hospitals differ at all levels due to the basic difference in their establishment, objectives and operation.
- The recruitment of employees of government sector hospitals is made by the U.P. government through a well defined procedure. Moreover, the government of Uttar Pradesh also planned to recruit doctors in government hospitals on contract basis temporarily but it cannot attract the doctors to join their in. On the contrary most of the private sector hospitals are found having sufficient number of medico and non-medico staff in their hospitals.
- In government hospitals, it is found that all power is centralized in CMOs and these people are generally scared of delegating their powers to their subordinates. In private sector hospitals the delegation of authorities and responsibilities among different levels of employees were observed methodically.
- In government sector hospitals the attitude of all levels of employees were not found courteous with the public due to shortage of staff, out of order work culture, corruption etc. This problem is not observed in private hospitals.
- The government hospitals of the area of study are experiencing the problem of financial crunch. While the private sector hospitals have no financial crises as they charge for providing healthcare services are unreasonably high.
- Researcher observed huge difference in the quality of medical staff. The staff members of private hospitals were found more disciplined and sincere where the staff members in government hospitals were observed having more sympathetic attitude toward s the economically weak section of society.
- More than 50 percent of patients of government hospitals complained about the noise, bad smell and so many other types of pollution in these hospitals while maximum number of patients of private hospitals found their hospital free from different types of pollutions.
- Most of the patients of government hospitals observed lack of coordination among different departments of hospital. On the contrary the patients of private hospitals were remained witness of cordial environment among different departments of their hospital.

- In government hospitals the employees of different departments were not observed in the capacity or in the mood of taking self decisions according to the circumstances while in private sector hospitals the concerning staff members were noticed taking decisions freely in the way of compilation of their responsibilities.
- Most of the patient of government hospitals complained about the autocratic and bureaucratic culture prevailed there in which turns the environment of these hospitals unfriendly for the patients. On the other side most of the patients of private hospitals appreciated their friendly organization culture.
- Almost all the patients of private hospitals felt the hardcore commercial attitude of administrators of these hospitals directly.
- The patient both the hospitals told that most of the terms & conditions of the hospitals were not explained to them at the time of entry in the hospital. When researcher queried this reason with the managerial personnel of the hospitals? They said that patients approached the hospital in the stage of emergency and at that time the emergency treatment of patient was on priority and it was not possible to discuss detailed terms and conditions of the hospital.
- The response of administrators of private hospitals was declared more sympathetic at time of any complaint by the patients in comparison to the response of administrator of government hospitals.
- Most of the patients of government hospitals were found dissatisfied with the behaviour of hospital staff. Most of them complained about the negative attitude of registration clerk and sweepers and only few patients appreciated the services of nursing staff to some extent. The patients of these hospitals were also not found satisfied with the services rendered to them by the doctors. On the contrary the patients of private hospitals appreciated the professional approach of all staff members of these hospitals such as receptionist, doctors, nurses, supporting staff etc.
- Only one third patients of government hospitals were satisfied with the Medicare services provided by the hospitals. The percentage of satisfied patients of private hospitals reached to 88 percent.
- ICU services of government hospitals could not provide satisfaction to their patients due to awful maintenance and unavailability of required machines by these facilities of private hospitals were very much praised by their customers.
- The quality of nursing services was observed far better in private hospitals as compare to government hospitals. Here it is important to note that the nursing services of government hospitals were praised by the maximum number of patients in comparison to other services provided by these healthcare units.
- Dietary services of government hospitals could not attract their patients while maximum number of patients of private hospitals were found satisfied with the quality and hygiene of food provided to them.
- Two third patients of government hospitals were satisfied with the purified water supply provided by the hospitals while all most the patients of private hospitals appreciated the drinking water facility provided by their healthcare unit.
- 72 percent patients of the government hospitals found the canteen facility available in the hospitals is economical but they also complaint about the cleanliness. 47percent visitors of private hospitals felt the charges of canteen of the hospitals are so high.
- Government hospitals are found keeping more parking spaces in comparison to private hospitals but the management of parking facility is observed more systematic in private hospitals.
- More than 60 percent of patients of private hospitals complained that internal medical store of the hospitals charge more in comparison to medical stores of outer side. Moreover, the most of the medicines prescribed by the private hospitals were available to these medical stores only. This fact is revealed during survey work that most of the private hospitals makes annual contract with the proprietor of internal medical store and charge heavy amount for the same. This results the increase in the price of medicines which has to bear by patients ultimately.
- Though the government hospitals do not charge any fee from patients accept the registration fee i.e. Rs. 100/-. These hospitals are financed by the state government completely, yet most of patients of these hospitals complained that the employees of these hospitals, from these hospitals complained that the employees of these hospitals, from doctors to sweeper expect some undue monetary consideration for providing genuine Medicare to the patients.
- Fee structure of private hospitals of the area of study is considered by the patients of these hospitals unreasonably high. The management and quality of healthcare services provided by the private hospitals undoubtedly are of high standard but these hospitals work purely as commercial units ignoring the social concern of their profession.

SUGGESTIONS

- It is the prime responsibility of a hospital management that all the services of a hospital are of world class. They should offer quality core and peripheral services at reasonable rates and at the time of need. They are supposed to blend the different services optimally so that the tarnished image of hospitals may be projected in a positive way.
- In the opinion of researcher the participation of public and private hospitals may be a solution of numbers of problems of hospital management. In such case government hospitals will be benefited with the expertise of private hospital management and private hospital may reduce the cost of infrastructure development significantly and may be able to provide the healthcare services to the masses at reasonable rate. But the strict regulatory provisions are required to avoid the misuse of such type of collaboration.
- There is an urgent need for high quality personals in government hospitals as in any other industry. A fully trained hospital employee can only ensure optimum and economical human resources with adequate level of education and skills when properly motivated to work with zeal and confidence can only achieve good results.

- In government hospital's admission procedure should be such a type that the patient may feel friendly, welcomed and secured. Every employee who comes in contact with the patient should make them feel that each one is genuinely interested in his welfare. OPD is the patient's first introduction to the hospital and it is the duty of hospital administration to ensure that it should be pleasant one.
- It is essential that a hospital manager in consultation with the doctors acting and in-charge knows about their requirements and makes available to so that they may provide the quality services.
- The administrator of utility services should be careful about the diet of patients, laundry services, uninterrupted power supply, engineering services, ambulance services, security services and other related services required in the hospital.
- It is essential that hospital manager keep in their minds the changing disease profile of particular catchments the area for which the hospital is to be started.
- The administration of government hospital should be transferred to the managerial professionals without any political or bureaucratic interference.
- A balanced and practical demand of finance should be followed up by the hospital management after critically analyzed the best use of resources available. It is only possible when government hospitals are managed by the management professionals and not by the doctors.
- It is essential that proper number of doctors should be appointed in government hospitals but this problem may be handled to some extent through systematic management of patient inflow made by management experts.
- It is suggested that in government hospitals rooms should be allotted according to the seriousness of the diseases and need of the patients. There should be well-laid out rules and management system so that the chances of favoritism may be ruled out.
- The researcher has a firm belief that the above mentioned suggestions would prove helpful to make the hospital management more effective and sound than the different functions of hospitals may be performed more efficiently in government as well as private hospitals and the patients would be able to get the more improved services.
- To get the international recognition and to maintain the quality standards of healthcare units the accreditation certification process must be encouraged in private as well as government hospitals.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BOOKS:

- Jaydeep Das Gupta; Hospital Administration and Management; Jaypee Brothers Medical Publishers (P) Ltd.; 2009.
- Michael Vimal Pillai, Hospital Management (New Initiatives/Dimensions), Published by the ICAI University Press; 2008.
- M.A. George; The Hospital Administrator; Jaypee Brothers Medical Publishers (P) Ltd.; 2003.
- A. K. Goel; Hospitals and the Community; Affiliated East-West Press Pvt. Ltd., New Delhi, 2005.
- Dr. Prashant Sarangi; Research Methodology, Taxman Publications (P.) LTD., New Delhi, 2010.
- Shakti Gupta & Sunil, Research Methodology (Concepts and Cases); Deepak Chawla and Veena Sondhi; Vikash Publishing House; 2011.
- K.N Krishnaswamy, Appa Iyer Sivakumar, M. Mathirajan; Management Research Methodology; Pearson Education Publications Pvt. Ltd. New Delhi, 2006.
- C. R. Kothari; Research Methodology; Wiley Eastern Ltd.; New Delhi, 2012.
- Gopa Kothari; Role of Hospitals in Primary Health Care; Article Published in the book Hospital Preventive & Promotive Services Published by Deep and Deep Publications Ltd., New Delhi, 2007.
- Harron Rashid; Health, Leisure and Recreation in Society; Kitab Mahal, Allahabad; 1998.
- K. K. Anand; Hospital Management: A New Prospective; Vikash Publishing House Pvt. Ltd., New Delhi, 1996.
- K. Narendera Jetli; Management in the 21st Century; New Century Publication, Mumbai, 1982.
- K. V. Ramani; It Enabled Applications in Government Hospitals in India; Research Paper Published in 37th International Conference on System Sciences, Calcutta; p.p.37 – 41; 2004.
- M. L. Kataria; The New Millennium Health Care in India; Article Published in Economic Times, New Delhi, 2004.
- M. Rashid; Government Healthcare System on Rampage; Classic Publication, Mumbai, 2001.
- R. D. Agarwal; Organization and Management; R. Tata Mc Graw Hill Publication, Mumbai, 1982.
- Rakich Jonathan S; Hospital Organization and Management; Snowball Publication Barberton, USA; 2000.
- S. M. Jha; Hospital Management; Himalaya Publishing House, New Delhi, 20036.
- Stanley & David; Hospital Management: An Evaluation; N Fosness Enterprises; Fargo; ND; USA, 1997.
- S. Talluru; Management of Hospitals; APH Publishing Corporation, Chennai, 2003.
- Parasuraman et al., 1985, 1988; Reidenbach & Sandifer-Smallwood, 1990; Babakus & Mangold, 1992; Zeithaml et al., 1993).

PERIODICALS AND NEWSPAPERS:

- Journal of Trade and Commerce (Half Yearly); Noida.
- The Journals of Commerce (Quarterly); Allahabad.
- The Journal of Management (Quarterly); New Delhi.

- Hospital Association of India (Monthly); Bangalore.
- AJN American Journal Nursing, Feb 2013, Volume 114. Number 2.

NEWS PAPERS:

- The Times of India; New Delhi.
- The Hindustan Times; New Delhi.
- The Economic Times; New Delhi.

